# #12 Gender and Racial/Ethnic Differences in Criminal Justice Decision Making in Intimate Partner Violence Cases Stan Shernock and Brenda Russell

Full article available in *Partner Abuse*, Volume 3, Issue 4, 2012. (Article available for free at: http://www.ingentaconnect.com/content/springer/pa)

The purpose of this literature review is to examine the existing empirical literature on gender, socio-economic status (SES), and racial/ethnic differences in the criminal justice responses to intimate partner violence. While the broader topic of differential treatment by criminal justice officials involves a whole range of official and unofficial behaviors toward suspects and victims, this paper focuses on decision making regarding arrest (see Table 1a), the issuance of protective orders (see Table 1b), prosecution (see Table 2a), and jury verdicts (see Table 2b).

Scholarly studies from 1985-2011 were located using a number of databases, including PSYCH-INFO, National Criminal Justice Reference Service, Criminal Justice Abstracts, Criminal Justice Periodicals, and Sociological Abstracts. Since specific search terms, such as "bias in arrest in domestic violence," led to so few sources, broader search terms such as "police (or law enforcement) response to intimate partner violence (or domestic violence)," and "arrest (or prosecution, restraining orders, or juries) and domestic violence (or intimate partner violence)," were used. This led to a total of about 2035 sources. Sources from the different databases were then cross-referenced to eliminate duplication and limited to peer-reviewed articles. Abstracts of the remaining sources were read to determine which were empirical and which examined socio-demographic and SES variables. After screening out irrelevant articles, a total of 16 were included for protective orders, 39 for arrest, 24 for prosecution, and 27 for jury decision making. An evaluation of the methodologies employed found that some studies have used one or multiple types of official data sources, such as police reports (incident forms, narratives or affidavits), court records, and criminal histories, while other studies have used interviews or surveys of victims or suspects; but few have used triangulation of both official

Copyright © 2012 Springer Publishing Company, LLC · http://dx.doi.org/10.1891/1946-6560.3.4.e12

sources and surveys or interviews. Almost all studies of differential decision making in jury verdicts have been experimental studies of simulated situations.

Most studies on differential treatment in arrest and prosecution have focused on gender and then race, while studies on differential decision making in the issuance of protective orders and jury decision making have focused primarily on gender. In the few studies that examined protective orders, judges were overwhelmingly more likely to issue them to women than to men seeking them (particularly in cases of less severe abuse histories), to impose greater restrictions on male defendants, and to defer cases of male plaintiffs, and deny requests at 10-day hearings. The overwhelming number of studies that examined differential arrest by gender found that male suspects are more likely to be arrested than female suspects; however, the difference in arrest rates was mitigated by dual arrests, which contribute to a significant increase in the number and greater likelihood of arrests of women. Greater arrest rates for women also seem to be affected by higher SES, and the presence of weapons and witnesses (legal factors).

Many students of IPV have argued that when examining the context and history associated with the arrest of women, particularly in dual arrest incidents, that women were engaged in self-defense. However, when official action was taken against women, there was greater leniency by citing instead of taking them into custody or by charging them with less serious offenses. While a small number of studies have not found evidence of differential treatment by prosecutors regarding the gender of the offender or victim, most studies with smaller community samples, and some with larger samples, found that males were consistently treated more severely at every stage of the prosecution process, particularly regarding the decision to prosecute, even when controlling for other variables (e.g., the presence of physical injuries) and when examined under different conditions. The gender discrepancy decreases somewhat with the decision to file felony or misdemeanor charges. In the few studies of gender differences in conviction and sentencing, most have found that male defendants are more likely to be convicted and to receive more severe sentences than female defendants. Subjects in experimental studies of jury decision making in IPV cases have stronger reactions to abuse committed against female victims and abuse committed by male perpetrators, with blame

and responsibility often attributed to male perpetrators of assault at higher rates than female perpetrators.

In studies of IPV that simply look at arrest rates in both single and dual arrest cases, as well as the general police handling of IPV incidents, there appears to be little differential treatment against racial minorities. Mandatory arrest policies appear to reduce the importance of victim race to insignificance. Most studies of decisions to prosecute, as well as the few studies on conviction and sentencing, have found that race and ethnicity were not statistically significant when specifying relevant conditions or controlling for other variables.

Thus, in terms of the differential criminal justice response regarding demographic categories, it appears that the less favorable treatment of males regarding the issuance of protection orders, arrest, and prosecution is most salient. However, before recommending new policies, interview and survey studies of legal actors should be undertaken in order to better understand the differential treatment found in studies using official sources, as well as how the concepts of "probable cause" and "primary aggressor" are interpreted when applied.

Moreover, future research studies on differential criminal justice response based on demographic and SES factors should include greater specifications and distinctions in the variables examined and broaden the scope of the samples and methods employed. First, studies need to better define the specific types of criminal justice response and distinguish them from related types of responses. For instance, since arrest in IPV is supposed to stop the violence, it is important to distinguish between arrest, which involves taking a suspect into custody and lodging him/her, and citation, which requires appearance in court at a later date. In order to understand whether a differential response is isolated or systemic, it is also important to examine other related police and prosecutor decisions, such as the decision regarding what to charge the suspect. Secondly, there is a need to specify the characteristics of those groups and both the situational and historic con-text where a differential criminal justice response has been found. Therefore, it is important to examine the interaction effects of other socio-demographic factors (particularly SES and age), relationship status, and situational conditions (e.g., presence of weapons or alcohol) with primary socio-demographic factors. Besides triangulating official sources with interviews and surveys in studies on protective orders, arrest, and prosecution,

experimental studies of jury decision should be complemented by using focus groups to better understand the group dynamics of juries; and with court records to compare findings from simulations with actual cases. Finally, since com-munity studies with small samples are not generalizable, there is a need for more multi-site or national studies.

**About the Authors** 

Stan K. Shernock, Ph.D., is the Charles A. Dana Professor and chair of the Department of

Justice Studies and Sociology at Norwich University. He received his B.A. in criminology from

the University of California (Berkeley), his M.A. in sociology from Indiana University, and his

Ph.D. in sociology from the University of Virginia. He has served as president of the North-

eastern Association of Criminal Justice Sciences, as a member of different committees of the

American Society of Criminology and Academy of Criminal Justice Sciences, as a consultant to

the National Institute of Justice, as an editorial board member of five journals of criminal justice,

and as book review editor of another. He has published numerous articles on policing topics, as

well as on other aspects of criminal justice and sociology.

Contact: sshernoc@norwich.edu

Brenda Russell, Ph.D., is an Associate Professor of Psychology at Penn State Berks. She

received her B.A. and M.A. in psychology from Central Connecticut State University and her

Ph.D. in psychology form Saint Louis University. Her scholarly and teaching interests include

psychology and law, perceptions of victims and perpetrators of domestic violence, homicide

defendants, and the social psychological and cognitive aspects of jury decision making. She is

particularly interested in how gender and sexual orientation play a role in evaluating defendants

in cases of domestic violence, rape, sexual coercion, bullying, and sexual harassment. Her

research on domestic violence can be seen in her book entitled Battered Woman Syndrome as a

Legal Defense: History, Effectiveness, and Implications. Dr. Russell also serves as consultant

and program evaluator for various federal and state educational, law enforcement, justice, and

treatment programs. Her teaching interests include introduction to psychology, social

psychology, psychology and the law (forensic psychology), research methods, social cognition,

program evaluation, careers in psychology, senior capstone, psychology of gender, and criminal

investigation.

Contact: blr15@psu.edu

5

Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

#### Large Population Samples—Studies based on National Survey Data

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
Bachman, R., and Coker, A. (1995). Police involvement in domestic violence: the interactive effects of victim injury, offender's history of violence, and race. Violence and Victims, 10, 91-106.	1535	This paper focuses exclusively on incidents of male perpetrated violence against female. The sample includes 1535 female victims of intimate-perpetrated violence (e.g., by husbands and boyfriends) taken from the National Crime Victimization Survey (NCVS) for the years 1987-1992.	The results reported in this study are based on violent crime victimization data from the National Crime Victimization Survey (NCVS) for the years 1987-1992.	Black-on-black victimizations affected the probability of arrest. Black men who victimized black women were more likely to be arrested compared to white offenders who had victimized white women. Racial status did not significantly affect the extent to which police arrived at the crime scene within 10 minutes. However, victims who resided in rural or suburban locations also reported significantly faster police response times compared to victims who resided in central cities. Black victims were more likely to report that police did more than file a report in their cases compared to white victims. Police also were more likely to do more than file a report of the incident for older female victims compared to younger victims.

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
•	_	Study uses data from National Survey Violence Against Women (and men) Authors examined 8,143 incidents (6,400 physical assaults and 1743 sexual assaults) based on 1963	The authors, using survey data, examined gender of the victim and offender, sexual assault or physical assault with a partner, family member, known or stranger. They examine whether the criminal justice system is more lenient toward men who	Police were unlikely to arrest women who assault male partners. Police (despite of gender of perpetrator and victim) were less likely to arrest in cases of minor violence. Mandatory arrest laws led to police being more likely to arrest men who assaulted
		cases reported to police. 568 cases involved arrest and 337 involved conviction	abuse female partners and to examine whether men who assault women are treated more leniently than other offenders. Trend analysis is also conducted, authors include statistical control for injury, armed, previous abuse, victim precipitation, etc.	their partners and were more lenient toward women, but not as lenient as they had been before mandatory arrest laws.

#### **Smaller Survey and Interview Samples**

Study		Sample	Study Type	Results
(full reference)		Characteristics		
Hamberger, L. (1997).	52	A group of 52 women	Data from counseling program	While 73% of these arrested
Female offenders in		arrested before and after	sessions—three one-hour pre-	women reported having initiated
domestic violence: a		the institution of	treatment evaluation sessions and	the violence at some time in their
look at actions in their		mandatory arrest. 84%	12 two-hour group sessions.	relationship compared to 77% of
context. Journal of		were white, 14%		their partners, different results
Aggression,		African-American, and		occur when asked the percent of
Maltreatment, and		2% Hispanic. 67.3%		occasions the woman or her

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
( = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = = =				
Trauma, 1, 117-129.		reported at least a high school education. 56.8% were employed outside the home. Their mean age was 29.5 years.		partner are the first to use physical force or aggression in a conflict. 25% of the women reported initiating violence 100% of the time. A total of 37% of the women reported their partners initiating violence 100% of the time. 55% of the women reported their partners initiating the violence more than half the time the violence occurred. In contrast, about 1/3 of the women reported initiating violence over half the time. Equal initiation rates were reported in only 12.5% of the cases. Hence, although many of these arrested women acknowledge having initiated violence against their partners, they typically did so in the context of a relationship in which the male partner initiated violence more often, and in which he was more likely to initiate the overall pattern of violence in the relationship. The most frequent reason for woman using aggression was self-defense/protection from an attack (24 women). Five other women

Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
Size			
			reported their aggression as
			retaliation for a previous assault
			and one for previous emotional
			abuse. Ten used violence to
			reduce tension or express
			negative feelings.
498	498 women who entered	A questionnaire was used to elicit	Results of this study do not
	a battered women's	types of abuse they experienced,	support advocates' concerns that
	shelter, which is the	police contact, and police-victim	domestic violence victims are
	largest domestic violence	interactions. It was developed by	frequently arrested by police who
		The state of the s	are called to the scene. However,
	Florida that is located in	•	the women arrested for domestic
	1		violence felt they had acted in
		-	self-defense. Only 22% of the
	<u> </u>	<b>1</b>	total 386 physical abuse victims
		-	indicated that their batterers were
	_	*	arrested. However, the majority
			of respondents described officers
		•	in positive terms.
		1	
		_	
		_	
	1		
	l '	=	
		,	
	under \$10,000.		
		1	
	Size	498 498 women who entered a battered women's shelter, which is the largest domestic violence shelter in the state of	498 498 women who entered a battered women's shelter, which is the largest domestic violence shelter in the state of Florida that is located in a central Florida county with a population of more than 900,000. Data collected on all consenting victims who entered the shelter from June 1995 to August 1996. There were approximately 48% white, 23% African-American, 25% Hispanic, and 4% Asian, American Indian, and other. 75% of the shelter population had an annual income of

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Abel, E. M., (2001)  Abel, E. M., (2001)  Comparing the social service utilization, exposure to violence, and trauma symptomology of demale "batterers"  Journal of Family  Violence, 16, 401-420.  The investigator used a convenience sampling approach. The sample of batterers was drawn from three batterer intervention programs and three domestic violence programs within the state of Florida. The total study sample included 118 participants, including 67 women enrolled in batterers' intervention programs and 51 women receiving victim services related to domestic violence.  The fact demographics and prior social service utilization, were collected using a brief questionnaire that was developed by the investigator. Exposure to violence of these demographics and prior social service utilization, were collected using a brief questionnaire that was developed by the investigator. Exposure to violence of these demographics and prior social service utilization, were collected using a brief questionnaire that was developed by the investigator. Exposure to violence of these demographics and prior social service utilization, were collected using a brief questionnaire that was developed by the investigator. Exposure to violence of these demographics and prior social service utilization, were collected using a brief questionnaire that was developed by the investigator. Exposure to violence of these belief the from the Life Experiences Survey that measures victim-related exposure to violence (e.g., being threatened, seeing someone else threatened, seeing someone else slapped, being someone else slapped, being someone else forced to do something sexual). The overall LES measures exposure to violence in the community, the school, and the home. Only those items within the LES that dealt with exposure to home-based batterers.	Study	Results	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>
Abel, E. M., (2001)  Abel, E. M., (2001)  The investigator used a convenience sampling approach. The sample of batterers was drawn from three batterer intervention programs and three domestic violence female "victims" and female "batterers"  Journal of Family Violence, 16, 401-420.  The investigator used a convenience sampling approach. The sample of batterers was drawn from three batterer intervention programs and three domestic violence victim service programs within the state of Florida. The total study sample included 118 participants, including 67 women enrolled in batterers' intervention programs and 51 women receiving victim services related to domestic violence.  The fact demographics and prior social service utilization, were collected using a brief questionnaire that was developed by the investigator. Exposure to violence was measured by using six items from the Life Experiences Survey that measures victim-related exposure to violence (e.g., being forced to do some-thing sexual, seeing someone else slapped, being someone else forced to do something sexual). The overall LES measures exposure to violence in the community, the school, and the home. Only those items within the LES that dealt with exposure to home-based	(full reference)		
because the second research and sough	Abel, E. M., (2001) Comparing the social service utilization, exposure to violence, and trauma symptomology of domestic violence female "victims" and female "batterers"  Journal of Family	The fact that nearly one-third of the respondents from the women in batterer groups reported previously utilizing shelters, a hotline, outreach services, or all of these is consistent with the belief that women in batterer programs may be victims who fought back and, as a result, were arrested. Viewing these findings through a feminist perspective would cause one to suspect that many of the female "batterers" were being re-victimized by a patriarchal criminal justice system. The social service utilization differences between the study groups two may also be related to other phenomena. One possibility is that women in batterer groups who have previously used victim services and sought medical treatment	The investigator used a convenience sampling approach. The sample of batterers was drawn from three batterer intervention programs and three domestic violence victim service programs within the state of Florida. The total study sample included 118 participants, including 67 women enrolled in batterers' intervention programs and 51 women receiving victim services related to
exposure to victim-related these viction violence, only those LES items that the		these victims may have decided	

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
			violence as a <i>victim</i> were	fighting back, they put
			employed Trauma	themselves at higher risk of
			symptomology was measured by	arrest. If arrested, they lose their
			the Trauma Symptom Checklist-	"victim" label and are perceived
			33) The instrument has five	by the criminal justice system as
			subscales (Dissociation, Anxiety,	"perpetrators." Information
			Depression, Post traumatic	about self-defensive actions
			Sexual-Abuse Trauma [PSAT]	should be taken into account
			and Sleep Disturbances), The	before labeling a client as either
			internal consistency of the five	victim or perpetrator. A
			subscales indicates reasonable	qualitative study that delineates
			alpha levels of .7f for the	the events leading up to the arrest
			subscales and .89 for the entire	of a woman partner would be
			instrument.	instrumental in helping develop a
				clearer profile of violent women.
Miller, J. (2003). An	385	A total of 595 victims	The data analyzed are from the	The Dade County population,
arresting experiment:		completed the first	victim interviews that were con-	according to the 1990 U.S.
Domestic violence		interview, but only 385	ducted as a part of the Dade	census, was 20.5% African
victim experiences and		victims completed the	County, Florida arrest experiment	American, yet 42.6% of the
perceptions. Journal of		follow-up or second	from the SARP. The study design	suspects in the Dade County
Interpersonal Violence,		interview. The study's	was devised to explain how legal	experiments were African-
<i>18</i> , 695-716.		attrition rate, similar to	and informal sanctions deter	American. Compared to Anglo
		all the other SARP	misdemeanor domestic violence	women, African-American
		studies, has no verifiable	perpetrators from repeated acts of	women are much less likely to
		explanation, although it	abuse or violence. The authors	call the police to arrest domestic
		likely includes refusals	examined empirically what the	violence suspects, or to use court
		from fearful women and	police did in response to a	procedures to stop the violence.
		the inability to locate	domestic violence call,	However, African American men,
		women who moved away	characteristics of the victim and	and their partners, were vastly
		from the suspects. The	the suspect, the victim's	over-represented in the Dade

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		analysis of the data was	perceptions of personal and legal	County experiment. A
		based on the second	power, and victim reports of	correlation analysis showed that
		interviews, because of	domestic violence following	departures from the conditions
		the high attrition rate,	police intervention. The	assigned were not related to the
		and was conducted for	experiment, conducted over a 3-	following characteristics, which
		exploratory purposes	year period, used a unique, two-	have been found in previous
		only.	assignment design. Police	research to be related to the
			randomly assigned each case to	occurrence of domestic violence:
			an arrest or to a no arrest	a woman's pregnancy,
			condition. Independently, they	employment status, marital status,
			randomly assigned 50% of the	or race or ethnicity.
			cases to a police Safe Streets Unit	
			for counseling and follow-up	
			investigation. They examined	
			arrest and Safe Streets assignment	
			as two types of experimental	
			conditions that could influence	
			recidivistic domestic violence	
			Of the assigned responses (arrest	
			versus no arrest), 90% were	
			actually delivered in the	
			experiment. The mis-assignment	
			rate, or departures from the	
			treatment or control group	
			assigned, was higher in Dade	
			County than it was in some of the	
			other sites (e.g., Milwaukee or	
			Omaha) but lower than it was in	
			Charlotte (13%). Across all the	
			SARP sites, the average mis-	

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		T	T	1
			assignment rate was	
			approximately 3% A total of	
			50.4% of the suspects were	
			arrested, as assigned, and a total	
			of 39.5% of the suspects were not	
			arrested, as assigned.	
			The data used to examine	
			personal and legal power were	
			taken exclusively from victim	
			interviews for two reasons	
			Because the victims were the	
			concern in this research, the	
			authors examined how their	
			personal and legal power can be	
			enhanced and thus used to	
			prevent reoccurring or repeated	
			domestic violence.	
Ammar, N., Orloff, L.,	230	Two hundred and thirty	The interview schedule was	The police response to this group
Dutton, M., & Aguilar-		immigrant Latina women	modeled after a Coalition for	of women demonstrates a lack of
Hass, G. (2005). Calls to		who had experienced	Immigrant and Refugee Rights	cultural sensitivity, and produces
police and police		violence or abuse from a	and Services (CIRRS) study	concerns regarding language
response: A case study		past or current intimate	conducted in San Francisco in	accessibility and low rates of
of Latina immigrant		partner constituted this	1990. The survey instrument in	arrest. Police response is typically
women in the USA.		sample. The assumption	this study sought information	measured in terms of response
International Journal of		of homogeneity of the	regarding demographics,	time and frequency of arrest.
Police Science and		terms Latina and	language abilities, immigration	Among those who called the
Management, 7, 230-		Hispanic is problematic	status, current problems, domestic	police the response rate was
244.		since it represents such a	violence, acculturation, support	generally good: 54.4 per cent (n =
		diverse cultural, political,	systems, economics, work	25) reported that police responded
		social and economic	history, housing, and other	within 15 minutes. Other

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		setting. The research	relevant data to help seeking.	response times were between 16-
		sample analyzed for this	Interviews were conducted in	30 minutes (26.1 per cent, n =
		study is drawn from a	Spanish with each session lasting	12), 31-60 minutes(6.5 per cent, n
		larger project on	approximately one to two hours.	= 3), and one hour or more
		immigrant women who		(14 per cent, $n = 6$ ). However, the
		reported intimate partner		events that transpired between the
		violence and who		time of arrival and departure of
		identified Spanish as		the police raise questions about
		their first language. The		the nature of police response in
		sampling process was not		the cases of battered immigrant
		a random one, and that		Latina women. Upon arrival, in
		poses important		nearly one-third of all cases (31.1
		limitations on the		per cent, $n = 14$ ) police never
		generalizability of the		spoke to the immigrant woman
		study. The women were		who made the call to the police
		recruited by		for help, speaking instead to the
		announcements		abusive partner (11 per cent, n =
		distributed at local		5) or to others (20 per cent, n =
		institutions in the		9). Although more than 75 per
		Washington DC		cent of the women in the sample
		metropolitan area,		spoke only a little English, only
		including schools, health		one-third (34 per cent, $n = 16$ ) of
		clinics, churches,		the women reported that Spanish
		community-based		was spoken when police arrived.
		organizations and by		Finally, a little over one-quarter
		snowball sampling. The		(28.6  per cent, n = 16)  of police
		participants were		calls resulted in the arrest of the
		matched in terms of		abusive partner. Among those
		ethnicity and language		who alleged an experience of a
		and were questioned by		form of violence that would

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
(tun reterence)		trained interviewers who were members of the participants' own community.		legally constitute a criminal offense, police made an arrest only 29.6 per cent (n = 16) of the time. Neither the immigrant victims or the perpetrators' immigration status nor the respondents' English language ability were related to whether (or not) the police made an arrest. The single most significant factor contributing to a decision by the police to make an arrest was whether the battered immigrant Latina woman had a protection order at the time of the call. Nearly one-third of respondents in the study, 32.7 percent (n = 17), reported having a protection
Gillis, J. R., Diamond, S. L., Jebely,P., Orekhovsky, V., Ostovich, E. M., MacIsaac, K., Sagrati, S., & Mandell, D. (2006). Systemic obstacles to battered women's participation in the judicial system:	20	Mean age 39, 45% White, 25% Indian, all were involved at one point in a long-term monogamous relationship with a male who assaulted them	Six focus groups were formed of women's experiences in domestic violence cases in the Canadian Legal Judicial System to investigate factors that influenced their decision to seek help, experience with police, courtroom and social services	order in effect when they called police.  Experience with police varied, delayed police response, not taken seriously, insensitive, errors and omissions. All women said they would never use the legal system in domestic situations again.

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
When will the				
status quo change?				
Violence Against				
Women, 12, 1150-1168.				
Frye, V., Haviland, M. & Rajah, V. (2007). Dual arrest and other unintended consequences of mandatory arrest in New York City: A Brief report. <i>Journal of Family Violence</i> , 22, 397–405	1685	1,685 helpline calls received from 5 New York areas (Manhattan, Brooklyn, Bronx, Queens, Staten Island). 183 cases where the main problem was police response. New York Family Violence Project (FVP) of Urban Justices Center set up a phone hotline in 1998-2000 to provide legal assistance and advocacy to DV victims. 99.5% of callers were women, 32% Latino, 34% Black, 18% White, 4% Asian or	Sample included 183 cases where the main problem was police response. Within these police response issues were 4 general types of problematic outcomes "no arrest" (n = 44), "unwanted arrest" (n = 9), "dual arrest" (n = 17), and retaliatory arrest (n = 44). There were 64 cases with too little information	Results found dual arrests were made more often when SES exceeded \$30,000. Retaliatory arrests were 2.4 times more likely when incomes were greater than \$30,000 compared to all other incomes combined. Callers in retaliatory arrests were twice as likely to have previous domestic incident reports. No arrests were least likely in Latina populations, and when an arrest was made and shouldn't have been the arrestee was more likely to be on public assistance and 2.3 times more likely to be Latino. Dual and retaliatory arrests that included the arrest of a female victim were
		other, 13% unknown		more likely to make more than \$30,000, not on public assistance, and more likely to be white.

Responses to Scenarios from Law Enforcement Officers, Recruits at Training Centers

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Finn, M. & Stalans L. (1997) The influence of gender and mental state on police decisions in domestic assault cases. <i>Criminal Justice and Behavior</i> , 24, 157-176.	130	Examined 130 officers' inferences about dangerousness, responsibility, credibility, and control, and, ultimately, their decision to arrest or refer for involuntary civil commitment in domestic violence cases. Participants obtained from public safety training centers responsible for providing in-service training to experienced officers and mandated training to rookie officers in the north Georgia area. 80.8% were male and 65.3% were white. Their mean age was 29.65 and they had a mean of 4.21 years of experience.	Used hypothetical scripts and experimental manipulation. Eight scripts were produced by manipulating two features: (1) the genders of the uninjured disputant (the assailant) and of the injured disputant (the victim), and (2) the assailant's mental state (normal, hallucinating, delusional, or drunken). Advanced clinical psychology students were used as raters to rate the assailant and victim on the presence and type of mental illness displayed. All five raters agreed on the presence/absence of signs of mental illness and the type of signs of mental illness for each manipulation.	The regression analysis revealed that officers were less likely to arrest female assailants compared to male assailants.  However, officers inferred that male victims of domestic assault had more control over their actions and were more responsible than female victims. Gender influenced the arrest decision through the officers' assessments of disputants' credibility and responsibility. Female mentally ill assailants were more likely than males to be referred for involuntary civil commitment.
Younglove. J., Kerr, M. & Vitello, C. (2002). Law enforcement officers' perceptions of	82	This study included 82 police officers in a midsize, central Calif. city. All three daily	The researchers crafted and field- tested a scenario depicting an incident of domestic violence to which two imaginary police	Results showed that the study's hypothesis that police officers would report differing perceptions about a scenario of

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
	T			,
same sex domestic		shifts in various	officers were responding; the	domestic violence based on
violence: Reason for		substations throughout	scenario contained gender-neutral	stereotypes or bias related to the
cautious optimism.		the city were involved	names and purposefully	sexual orientation of the involved
Journal of Inter-		Participation was	ambiguous facts. Four versions of	couple was not supported.
personal Violence, 17,		voluntary (although only	the scenario were created to	
760-772.		a few officers declined),	correspond to four groups. For	
		and all participants	three of the groups, the last	
		signed consent forms that	sentence of the scenario was	
		reiterated the anonymous	varied to indicate the sexual	
		nature of the survey and	orientation of the involved couple	
		the researchers'	as lesbian, gay male, or	
		disinterest in any	heterosexual. For the fourth	
		identifying information.	group, the last sentence did not	
		Participants were asked	indicate sexual orientation.	
		to report the number of	There were 10 questions designed	
		years employed in law	to elicit perception about specific	
		enforcement, with 71	features of the scenario and its	
		self-reports varying from	consequences for the parties	
		7 months to 30 years.	depicted and for the imaginary	
		The average amount of	responding officers. The	
		experience per officer	questions were designed to	
		was 11 years. All results	capture application of stereotypes	
		indicated varying levels	about gay and lesbian	
		of experience responding	relationships, particularly with	
		to domestic violence	respect to the legitimacy or	
		reports.	"realness" of them. For example,	
			one stereotype is that lesbians and	
			gay men do not have relation-	
			ships but rather fleeting, one-	
			night stands.	

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Finn, M. A. & Bettis, P. (2006). Punitive action or gentle persuasion: Exploring police officers' justifications for using dual arrest in domestic violence cases. Violence Against Women, 12, 268-287.	80	Pilot study used 80 officers to examine the appropriateness of scripts.  The study examined 24 officers from training center in Georgia mean age = 30.	Authors used an experiment and investigated qualitative and quantitative approaches to understand the justification and rationale for why police officers engage in dual arrests in a state with primary aggressor laws. They used an experimental approach that varied the presence of injury of the wife, offensive injuries, and whether the couple was conciliatory or antagonistic toward each other. Officers were asked to write down their thoughts on the script and how they would handle the incident.	When disputants were antagonistic officers rated the husband as less willing to settle the argument with the wife compared to wife wanting to reconcile with husband. Officers also rated the husband more hostile in antagonistic scenarios compared to non-antagonistic scenarios. Qualitative content analysis found experienced officers reported they would use dual arrest. All but 3 stated they would take the husband into custody but would issue a citation to the wife. Justification for dual arrest revolved around being justified by law, both admit, both injured, both arrested. Officers who opted for dual arrest were more likely to believe getting the couple into the criminal justice system would provide needed support and help needed.
Cormier, N. & Woodworth, M. T.	108	108 undergraduates from a Canadian university (41	Repeated measures experimental design to examine reactions to	Analyses found that student and RCMP ratings of abuse severity
(2008). Do you see what		men and 67 women) and	scenarios depicting male-female,	were both highest for the male-
I see? The influence of		62 Royal Canadian	male-male, female-male and female-female abuse. Authors	female scenario. However, the RCMP considered the female-
gender stereotypes on student and Royal		Mounted Police (35 men and 27 women)	examined 4 vignettes (based on	male, male-male, and female-

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP)		Student mean age 23.5 and RCMP mean age	Harris and Cook's 1994 study) of a dispute escalating to a physical	female scenarios to be more abusive than did the students.
perceptions of violent same-sex and opposite- sex relationships. Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma, 17, 478-505.		39.78	altercation. Subjects rate, seriousness, culpability, abuse severity, likeability, likelihood of police intervention, recidivism, etc	Their findings suggest that, while the RCMP appeared to be more sensitive to male and same-sex victims than students, both groups remain somewhat biased.

#### **Interviews of Criminal Justice Professionals and Service Providers**

Study	Sample	Sample	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	Characteristics		
Miller, S. L. (2001).	37	37 criminal justice	Use of interview data from	Respondents felt they were seeing
The paradox of women		professionals and service	criminal justice professionals and	an increase in the number of dual
arrested for domestic		providers. The	service providers who deal	arrests (as a consequence of pro-
violence: criminal		respondents included 2	directly with women arrested for	arrest policies), which was
justice professionals		directors of women's	domes-tic violence charges.	discouraging because it meant that
and service providers		shelters, 4 caseworkers in	Interviews lasted from one to	police were not thoroughly
respond. Violence		shelters, 7 victim service	three hours. Using grounded	investigating the context of the
Against Women, 7,		workers affiliated with	theory methods, three themes	incident to deter-mine the primary
1339-1376.		police departments (4	emerged from the interviews.	aggressor. Respondents felt that
		social workers and 3		police took the easy way out by
		police officers), 3		arresting both parties, which left
		treatment providers who		charging decisions up to the
		run counseling groups for		attorney general's office. They felt
		arrested women, 5		that the police were over-enforcing,
		probation officers, 5		or at least not taking the time to
		prosecutors and social		make the wisest decisions. Several

Study	_	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
	,	workers, 5 public	1	respondents mentioned that police
		defenders (lawyers and	1	nave indicated to a woman victim
		social workers), and 6	1	that they regretted making the arrest
		family court advocates.	1	because she did not fit the
				stereotypical image of a violent,
				out-of-control woman.

## Studies Using National Incident-Based Reporting System (NIBRS)

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Eitle, D. (2005). The	53,176	These data do provide	Two data sources are used in the	Of the three extralegal variables
influence of mandatory		insight into the pattern of	present study: (a) data for the	(race, gender, and age), two—age
arrest policies, police		arrest probabilities for	year 2000 from the National	and race—were found to be
organizational		more than 53,176	Incident-Based Reporting	significant predictors of the
characteristics, and		offenders across 115	System (NIBRS) for offender,	dependent variable. Consistent
situational variables on		cities. Comparisons	offense, and arrest information;	with Black's theory of legal
the probability of arrest		between the sample data	and (b) the Law Enforcement	control, black victims and younger
in domestic violence		and the complete	Management and Administrative	victims are significantly less likely
cases. Crime &		LEMAS (Law	Statistics (LEMAS) for police	to have their cases result in the
Delinquency 51, 573-		Enforcement	departmental organizational	arrest of the suspect. However,
597.		Management and	information for the year 2000.	these findings reveal no support
		Administrative Statistics)	The size of the cities served by	for the notion that gender plays a
		data set on police	these police departments is best	significant role in the likelihood of
		departments suggest that	described as small to medium,	arrest in domestic violence cases,
		the sample is	ranging from populations of	consistent with previous research.
		representative of police	25,000 to more than 660,000.	These results reveal that both
		departments serving		mandatory arrest policies and the
		small U.S. cities.		overall crime rate appear to

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
,	<b>'</b>			
				condition the relationships
				between victim race and arrest risk
				and victim age and arrest risk. As
				expected, mandatory arrest
				policies appear to reduce the
				importance of victim race to
				insignificance: Under conditions
				of no mandatory arrest policy,
				black victims are significantly less
				likely to have their cases result in
				the arrest of the suspect. The crime
				rate, however, serves to exacerbate
				the influence of victim relatively
				high crime rates in a given
				jurisdiction, Black victims are
				significantly less likely to have
				their cases result in arrest (relative
				to white victims)
				than in jurisdictions with relatively
				lower overall rates of crime. There
				is no support for the notion that
				mandatory arrest policies or the
				overall crime rate moderate the
				association between victim gender
				and the dependent variable.
				Another extralegal characteristic,
				victim age, was also found to
				differ in the strength of its
				association with arrest risk
				depending on the presence of a

Study (full reference)	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Younyol, Y. (2006). A Cross-cultural analysis of domestic violence in a minority community and police response: A case study of Hmong offenders.  International  Journal of Comparative and Applied Criminal  Justice, 30, 49-74.	79	82 police officers responded to survey and 79 were used. 68 males and 11 females. 85% white, majority patrol officers, average length of experience 9 years.	Survey of police attitudes and experience with Hmong culture. Author examined responses to domestic violence responses among Hmong and non-Hmong domestic violence incidents,	mandatory arrest policy and the overall crime rate. In addition, spatial differentiation was also significantly associated with the magnitude of the victim age coefficient. Mandatory arrest policies, spatial differentiation, and the overall crime rate each serve to magnify the influence of victim age on arrest risk. Older victims are significantly more likely to have their cases result in an arrest in jurisdictions that have employed a mandatory arrest policy.  Offenders were primarily male in Hmong and non-Hmong groups. The majority of Hmong IPV's were married (83.9%). Hmong victims were less likely to call police than non-Hmong victims. Officers were less likely to arrest in Hmong cultures compared to non-Hmong cultures. Officers with more experience in Hmong culture were less likely to arrest Hmong DVs. The majority (80%) of officers believed that Hmong culture tolerated IPV culture and officers who believed this were

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

**Study Type** 

Results

Sample Characteristics

Study

(full reference)	Size	•		
		1		
				less likely to arrest than officers
				who did not believe this.
Hirschel, D., Buzawa,	577,862	Phase 1 included data	Phase 1 included archival	Overall dual arrest rate was 1.3%
E., Pattavina, A.,		from NIBRS (2000)	analysis of arrests (arrest one,	and higher for intimate partners vs.
Faggiani, D., &		577,862 police records	both, or no one) in intimate	other domestics, acquaintances or
Reuland, M. (2007).		from 2,819 police	partner disputes	strangers. Mandatory arrest
Explaining the		departments in 19 states	Phase 2 included on-site visits,	increased the likelihood of dual
prevalence, context,		Phase 2 included 25	police records, interviews, and	arrest. Dual arrests were more
and consequences of		police departments in 4	analysis of court records for re-	likely in same-sex couples
dual arrest in intimate		states.	offense.	compared to heterosexual couples.
partner cases. Final		Phase 2 derived a sample		
Report submitted to the		from ID, TN, VA, and		
National Institute of		CT, with 8 core sites and		
Justice. 177		17 satellite sites with 220		
Pages.		single and no arrest cases		
Pattavina, A., Hirschel,	176,488	Use of NIBRS data from	Correlational study of official	Arrest was more likely in cases
D., Buzawa, E.,		2000. 176,488 intimate	police statistics (NIBRS) to	involving a white victim compared
Faggiani, D., &		partner violence (IPV)	determine factors that predict	to a minority victim. Incidents
Bentley, H. (2007).		assaults and intimidation	arrest in same sex vs.	involving male victims were more
A comparison of the		incidents reported to	heterosexual couples, using	likely to lead to arrest than female
police response to		2,819 police departments	individual, situational, and legal	victims. The probability of arrest
heterosexual versus		in 19 states.	contexts, race, sex, and sexual	was slightly higher for male
same-sex intimate		Of the 176,488 IPV	orientation	victims in hetero-sexual
partner violence.		incidents, 50% resulted		relationships than male victims in
Violence Against		in arrest, 99% of		homosexual relationships. Being a
Women, 13, 374-394.		incidents were		mandatory arrest state was a
		heterosexual couples, and		positive predictor for arrest of
		less than 1% were		female same-sex couples but not
		homosexual couples		for male same-sex couples. In
				states using statutory language that

(full reference) Size		
E., Hirschel, D., & 367,402 in Faggiani, D. (2007). Policy, place, and perpetrators: Using NIBRS to explain arrest arrest rate	correlational study of office police data (NIBRS) to determine how arrest police urbanization, incident circumstances, and offender characteristics affect outcoming domestic violence cases.	to be arrested than white offenders. Men were more likely to be arrested than women in IPV incidents.

### Studies using Official Sources (Police Reports) and Samples of Law Enforcement Officers

Study	Sample	Sample	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	Characteristics		
Fyfe, J. Klinger, D.,	994	The lawyer for the	Data used in the study drawn	Probability of arrest was
Flavin, J. (1997).		plaintiffs in a lawsuit	from police department records	significantly lower in male-on-
Differential police		obtained data on assault	obtained during the course of a	female spousal cases than in other
treatment of male-on-		complaints and	lawsuit alleging police failure to	violence cases (which holds after

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
			T	
female spousal violence.		processing. The data	protect a woman who was	taking in account several controls).
Criminology, 35, 455-		covered all Chester, PA.	repeatedly assaulted by a male	The logit modeling disclosed that
473.		Police Department	partner and eventually killed.	the likelihood of arrest was not
		reports of assaults for		affected by the race of the
		approximately 15 months		involved parties or the level of
		immediately prior to the		poverty in which the attack
		victim's death and		occurred. The logit model also
		included 994 cases.		indicated that Chester officers less
		Researchers eliminated		often arrested in cases in which
		from data 272 cases in		females attacked males, as
		which victims had no		compared to cases of male-on
		idea who attacked them.		male violence.
		This left 772 cases in		
		which either assailants		
		were on the scene when		
		police arrived or there		
		was substantial evidence		
		of the offenders' identity.		
		They excluded an		
		additional 196 cases		
		involving a known		
		juvenile suspect. Of the		
		525 cases that remained,		
		they deleted 7 cases in		
		which offenders were		
		arrested under the		
		authority of court orders		
		issued prior to the		
		assaults in question, on		
		the grounds that the		

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study Type

Possiles

Page 15

Page 1

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		T		,
		arrests were the results of		
		court mandates rather		
		than officers' discretion.		
		Then they eliminate 115		
		misdemeanor assaults.		
		Finally, they eliminated		
		11 more cases in which		
		the sex of the victim		
		and/or the suspect could		
		not be determined. This		
		left 392 non-stranger,		
		felony-grade assaults and		
		other violent crimes		
		committed by adults who		
		were identified and not		
		arrested pursuant to		
		existing court orders. Of		
		these, there were 82		
		male-on-female spousal		
		cases and 27 where		
		women attacked their		
		male partners.		
Buzawa, E., Hotaling,	353	Data used in this report	To facilitate their research	The police did not make
G., Klein, A., & Byrne		are based upon domestic	design, information was needed	discriminations in their handling
J. (1999). Response to		violence cases that	from multiple sources and	of incidents on the basis of
Domestic Violence in a		resulted in an arrest and	perspectives covering data from	offender characteristics. No
Pro-active Court Setting		arraignment before the	significant periods of time both	differences in the amount of police
– Final Report. National		Quincy District Court	before and after the occurrence	activity were found on the basis of
Institute of Justice. 177		during a 7-month study	of the incident that led to its	the offender's age or race. It was
pages		period. All consecutive	inclusion in the sample. In	also found that victim satisfaction

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
	1		Lagre e a la la company	
		arrests for domestic	addition to procuring these data,	with police was not related to
		violence involving male	an additional challenge was to	demographic characteristics such
		defendants and female	link together information from	as age and race.
		victims that occurred	several sources into one coherent	
		between June 1995 and	data file. Sources of data include	
		February 1996 were	offender criminal history data,	
		initially examined for	records of civil restraining	
		inclusion in the final	orders, probation department	
		sample. From that pool,	data on prosecutorial charges,	
		they eliminated all cases	case disposition and risk	
		involving defendants and	assessment, data on offender	
		primary victims who	treatment program participation,	
		were under the age of 17,	police incident reports, and self-	
		cases involving same-sex	report victim survey data.	
		relationships, and cases	Police reports were most	
		involving male victims	relevant to the specific question	
		and female defendants.	regarding bias in arrest. A key	
		The final sample is	data source used in this study	
		composed of 353 cases of	was the police reports for the	
		male-to-female domestic	study incidents from the seven	
		violence. It can also be	departments served by the	
		described as a	Quincy District Court. These	
		population, since it	reports were used to measure the	
		includes every case in	officer's perspective and actions	
		this category of incidents	taken about the incident, what	
		which occurred during	the call for service involved,	
		the study's data	characteristics of the incident,	
		collection period. They	socio-demographics of the	
		were able to retrieve	participants and their narrative	
		police reports and/or	description of the incidents and	

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest Sample | Sample Characteristics

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
		police intake forms for 89% (317 of 353) of the study incidents.	their stated response.	
Jones, D. A., & Belknap, J. (1999). Police responses to battering in a progressive pro-arrest jurisdiction. <i>Justice Quarterly</i> , 15, 249-273.	1521	Police reports for alleged abuse among adults in Boulder, Colorado from January 1 <sup>st</sup> – December 31 <sup>st</sup> , 1994. Included eight law enforcement agencies.	A study using official records (police reports). Included two dependent variables: (1) whether any formal police action taken (jail, warrant, book, release, or court summons); and (2) whether defendant was jailed. Included three main groups of independent variables: (1) victim offender characteristics (victim-offender relationship, race, age, sex, prior formal and informal contact with police); (2) incident characteristics; (3) police charges.	Study found that those identified as male victims were more than three times as likely to be part of a dual arrest couple then those individuals identified as female victims.
Robinson, A. & Chandek, M. (2000). Differential police response to black battered women. Women and Criminal Justice, 12, 29-61.	1313 465 (final sample)	1313 domestic violence cases that took place during the five month data collection period. In only 36% of these incidents (471) were all three data sources available. Six cases of victims of other races were removed in order to compare blacks and	Three sources of data were used in the study. Paper-work routinely completed by officers at the scene of a domestic violence call, referred to as Domestic Violence Case Summaries (basically a incident reporting form). It includes information on whether probable cause exists, demographic data on disputants, whether weapons,	In the bivariate analysis, black battered women were significantly less likely to have arrests made on their behalf; 26% in their case versus 36% in case of other victims. Arrests were also significantly less when victims were less than 30 years old. Suspects who were young and black were less likely to be arrested. White officers were

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
	T		1 1 1 1 6	
		whites. So the final	and witnesses involved, level of	significantly more likely to make
		sample was 465 incidents	injury, etc. Secondly, a	arrests at the scene than were their
		(cases).	supplemental form developed by	minority counterparts.
			researchers, which asked officers	The black female victim variable
			their perceptions of victim	was not significant in the
			(cooperativeness, emotional	multivariate analysis. For non-
			state). Thirdly, demographic	black victims, age was positively
			data on officers.	and significantly related to arrest.
				Older victims were 18 times more
				likely to have an arrest made on
				their behalf compared to younger
				victims. For black battered
				women, older suspects were more
				than four times more likely to be
				arrested than their younger
				counterparts. For "other" victims,
				the likelihood of arrest decreased
				as suspect age increased. Also
				officers were less likely to make
				an arrest for black females
				believed to have had a drug or
				alcohol problem. Also black
				women who had children present
				at the scene were significantly less
				likely to be afforded police
				protection in the form of arrest. In
				contrast, arrest was almost three
				times more likely for "other"
				victims with children.
Lane, E., Lucera, J., &	1376	Relevant to bias in arrest,	This study was conducted	When examined by police action,

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Boba, R. (2002). Office		data in this study	between February 2000 and June	an interesting difference emerges.
of Community Oriented		examined 1376 police	2001, and involved collection	While single arrest was the most
Policing Services		outcomes (warrants,	and analysis of qualitative and	common outcome for cases
Community		arrests, and dual arrests)	quantitative data. Part one of this	involving black and white
Policing/Domestic		using domestic violence	report presents the qualitative	offenders, among black offenders,
Violence Test Site		incident reports.	findings about the Domestic	the percent disposed by single
Project: Inter-Agency		Less relevant to	Violence Coordinating	arrest and by warrant is almost
Response to Domestic		examining bias in arrest,	Committee (DVCC) and the	equal, whereas among white
Violence in a Medium		24 in-person and two	domestic violence service	offenders, the percentage of cases
Sized City. POLICE		phone interviews were	delivery community. Part two of	disposed by arrest is much higher
FOUNDATION.		conducted. A central aim	this report contains two separate	than the percentage where a
Prepared for the U.S.		of the present study was	quantitative analyses. The data	warrant was issued. Similarly, the
Department of Justice		to identify the role,	relevant to the topic of bias in	percentage of whites to whom dual
Office of Community		activities and working	arrest in this study draws from	arrest is applied is greater than that
Oriented Policing		relationships of the	domestic violence incident	of blacks and other race offenders.
Services. 176 pages. <sup>1</sup>		police. Eight of the 26	reports, referred to here as	Police outcomes for other race
		interviewees were from	(DVRs), which officers are	offenders are more similar to cases
		local police agencies.	required to complete for all	involving black offenders than to
		This included officers	domestic violence incidents. The	white offenders,
		from the city police	DVRs provide more detailed	but again, since there were only 41
		department as well as	information than the standard	offenders of other races, 21 who
		officers from the campus	criminal incident report, which	received a warrant, 19 who were
		police department of a	officers completed in addition to	arrested, and one who was dual
		local university.	the DVR if a crime has been	arrested, generalizations about this
		Of the offenders whose	committed. Information on the	group are tentative.
		race is known, 86.3 % of	DVR includes demographic,	
		the offenders are black,	relationship, and address	
		10.5 % are white, and 3.2	information on the parties	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Interviews were also conducted in this study.

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
		% are of another race ("other").	involved; the location, date, and time, of the incident; police action taken, presence of children, apparent use of alcohol or drugs by either of the parties, weapon use, victim injuries, and whether protective orders were on file.  The larger study used GIS crime mapping to answer other research questions not relevant to bias in arrest.	
Ho, T., (2003) The influence of suspect gender in domestic violence arrests [dagger] American Journal of Criminal Justice. 27 183-195.	428	The study group of 428 original and follow-up reports of domestic aggravated assault consists of two subsamples selected from 5613 general aggravated case filed at the Columbia (SC) PD between the years 1993-1997. There were 214 cases of female-against-male and 885 maleagainst-female domestic aggravated assaults. While all 214 of the female perpetrators were retained for analysis, a	Police reports of domestic aggravated assault (with and without a weapon). Includes cases where there are heterosexual boyfriends and girlfriends, spouses, co-habitants, or ex-partners who are at least 17 years old. Aggravated assault cases involving other relationships, unfounded incidents, mutual combat, and dual arrest were excluded from analysis. Also excluded misdemeanors.	An arrest took place in 36.4% of the incidents involving female suspects and in 36% of incidents involving male suspects. Although there were more male than female suspects in upper income areas, men had a lower arrest rate than did women. By contrast there were no differences between the population and the arrest rate by gender in lower income areas. Officers are more likely to arrest male suspects if a weapon was involved and there were witnesses to the incident. Given this, the author states that officers tend to rely on a wider range of arrest factors for men than for women.

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		random sample of 214		Racial composition of the couple
		cases of male suspects		was a non-significant predictor of
		was selected for		arrest.
		inclusion. Using two		
		identical sample sizes		
		made it possible to com-		
		pare arrest determinants		
		with greater accuracy.		
Henning, K. & Feder, L.	6,704	From the initial pool of	Intimate partner has been	On the basis of data coded by
(2004) A comparison of		7,342 participants, 152	operationalized in this study to	release counselors, female
men and women		cases (2%) were dropped	include current and former	arrestees were significantly more
arrested for domestic		because identifying	dating partners or spouses.	likely to experience a dual arrest
violence: Who presents		information on the victim	Complete or partial criminal	than were their male arrested
the greater threat?		and/or offender was	justice records were available on	counterparts. That is, women were
Journal of Family		missing. Additionally,	7,342 (53%) of the arrestees	more likely to be arrested along
Violence, 19, 69-80.		486 records (6.6%)	involved in these intimate	with their partner/spouse than
		representing repeat	partner cases. Jail release	were men (34% vs. 7%,
		arrests on the same	counselors working for the	respectively). The data also
		victim-offender pairs	County's Pretrial Services	indicate that women arrestees are
		were excluded from	division collected the data that	significantly more likely than their
		further analyses leaving	was provided to the researchers	male counterparts to have been
		only the most recent	on the 7,342 cases. Counselors	charged with a felony assault and
		arrest. Their final sample	entered information on all	to have used a weapon during the
		consisted of 48.7%	domestic violence arrests into a	incident. Yet, it was found that
		(6,704) of the individuals	computerized data-base that was	when using victim reported
		arrested for assaulting an	implemented at Pretrial Services	information and data collected by
		intimate partner of the	in August of 2000. Many of the	local criminal justice agencies,
		opposite gender in	victims were not reached,	female arrestees were significantly
		Shelby County, TN	however, resulting in the	less likely than males to have
		during the study's time	majority of the 6,428 arrest cases	histories that warrant concern

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		matching cases. Exact		episode according to police
		matches were found for		reports. In contrast to the police
		317 (69.1%) of the		data, the information collected
		women dually arrested.		from interviews indicated a
		No difference in		number of differences between
		woman's age, race,		male and female arrestees in their
		relationship to victim, or		recent use of intimate violence.
		characteristics of the		While interview data indicated that
		index offense between		females were more likely to use a
		matched and unmatched		weapon against their partner in the
		cases. 80% of men and		instant offense, male arrestees
		women were African		were more likely to have used
		American and 20% were		drugs. However, male arrestees
		Caucasian. Men were		were significantly more likely to
		slightly older than the		have physically assaulted their
		women (32.2 vs. 30.2).		partners, to injure their partner,
		A majority of couples		and to demonstrate a pattern of
		were current or former		increasing severity and/or
		dating partners (72%) as		frequency of violence against their
		opposed to spouses or ex-		partner in comparison to female
		spouses (28%). 61% of		offenders. Thus, females were
		the women had children		more likely to view their partner as
		living in their home at		a serious threat and more likely to
		the time of the offense.		want to end the relationship. While
				there were no significant
				differences between males and
				females in their reports of prior
				violations (e.g., slapping, kicking,
				biting, hitting with a fist) or severe
				abuse (e.g., choking, threatening

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Study Type	Results
		,	
			partner with gun or knife or
			injured partner during a fight),
			males were significantly more
			likely to have forced their partners
			into unwanted sexual activity and
			to have necessitated a call to the
			police due to their violence. Males
			had an overall higher physical
			violence rating compared to their
			female counter-parts and were
			significantly more likely to
			threaten to kill their partner or
			children than their female
			counterparts. Male arrestees were
			also significantly more likely to
			show a history of domestic and
			nondomestic criminality than their
			female counterparts. The
			interviews revealed similar gender
			differences in criminal lifestyles of
			these defendants. Thus, results
			from both criminal justice data and
			interviews showed that male
			arrestees had the greater proclivity
			to use violence based on both past
			histories as well as present reports.
			The authors
			conclude that this would lead to
			viewing many of these dually
			arrested women as not engaging in

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

**Study Type** 

Results

Sample Sample Characteristics

Study

Stady	Sumpre	sumple characteristics	staay Type	TTC S GT C S
(full reference)	Size			
				mutual combat but instead
				defending themselves.
Renauer, B. & Henning,	6890	Database included DV	Police reports.	Female DV offenders as a group
K. (2005). Investigating		suspects from Memphis,	The Portland database, unlike	were significantly less likely to
intersections between		TN and Portland, OR.	that of Memphis, did not	recidivate as a suspect and fewer
gender and intimate		Memphis sample	consistently record the nature of	women had multiple new offenses.
violence recidivism.		consisted of 880 suspects	the relationship between suspect	When the women did show up
Journal of Offender		(440 men and 440	and victim.	again in subsequent DV reports it
Rehabilitation 41, 99-		women) identified in		was more commonly as a victim.
124.		local police reports as		This pattern of results suggests
		having committed a DV		that many of the women who were
		offense against a current		cited as suspects were the primary
		or former heterosexual		victim of aggression in their
		partner in 1997. The		relationship. The police officers
		researchers originally		who responded to the instant
		identified 460 female		offense, whether through a lack of
		suspects whose full name		training, poor information, or
		and birth date recorded,		manipulation by the male batterer,
		and then eliminated 20		or some form of personal or
		repeat offenders in the		institutional bias, failed to
		same year. They selected		correctly identify the male as
		a random sample of 440		aggressor.
		male suspects from the		
		4882 suspects first		
		identified. The Portland		
		sample consisted of 6010		
		individuals (5289 men		
		and 721 women)		
		identified in police		
		records as a suspect in a		

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
Shernock, S. (2005). Police categorization and disposition of non-lethal partner violence incidents involving women offenders in a statewide rural jurisdiction with a presumptive arrest policy. Family Violence & Sexual Assault Bulletin 21, 11-17.	288	DV offense from the year 2000. Suspects were included whether they were arrested or not. In Portland sample they eliminated cases with multiple suspects and multiple victims, juveniles, and those of same gender.  All 288 cases of intimate partner violence that have been identified as coming to the attention of the Vermont State Police, which has a presumptive arrest policy, during the 2000 calendar year. There were 68 women and 220 men characterized as offenders.	Includes incident report forms and accompanying narratives and affidavits (when substantively different from narratives), which provide elaborated descriptions of variables in the incident report forms or additional information on variables not in the forms.	When distinguishing between arrest and citation dispositions and when evaluating disposition in terms of two types of police categorization, offenders and victim/offenders, women offenders were found consistently to be treated more leniently than males in the same roles. In all cases (a) when there are single offenders, (b) when there are dual offenders, and (c) when single and dual offenders are treated together, the findings are consistent. Females are much more likely than males to be cited instead of arrested and males are much more likely to be arrested than cited. While there is almost no difference between males and females in these two

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
Buzawa, E.& Hotaling, G. (2006). The relationship to status, gender, and minor status in the police response to domestic assaults. Victims and Offenders: A Journal of Evidence-Based Policies and Practices, 1, 323-360.	320	327 domestic violence calls from 5 towns in the NE with pro-arrest policies in place-with complete data on 320 cases Data from police records on 320 domestic violence calls for assistance collected during a four-month period from five jurisdictions operating under a pro-arrest statute in a Northeastern state were examined to determine the distribution of incidents by victim-suspect household relationship. 185 (47%) of adult female partners, ex- partners, or ex-dating partners were involved in 167 (48%) cases of domestic violence incidents suggesting 52% of incidents did not	Archival analysis of police reports and police decisions at the scene. Police classified the incident as a legal incident (DV), compliance with statutory requirements (arrest or warrant issued), incident characteristics (restraining order, physical harm, threats, injury, etc), and relationship of victim and perpetrator	roles in regard to official or no official action, women are much more likely than men to be issued citations than to be arrested.  Females were identified as primary offenders in approximately 25% of incidents reported to police and their odds of arrest were 2.5 higher than males. Odds of arrest increased for females across all household relationships but only in incidents involving actual use of violence. Males and females were equally likely to be arrested if there was a restraining order violation and when the incident included threats of injury.

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study Type

Possite

Page 15

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		involve male against		
		female intimate partner		
		violence. Over 1/3 of		
		cases involved parents		
		and adult or adolescent		
		children, siblings or other		
		household members.		
Houry, D., Reddy, S. &	1,505	1505 paired police and	Authors examined correlates of	Most IPV victims were African
Parramore, C (2006).	·	911 call reports of female	co-arrest. Archival records were	American (92%) and younger than
Characteristics of		victims who called 911	coded for victim/offender	age 35. Of the IPV victims 9%
victims co-arrested for		for IPV in Atlanta using	relationship, SES, presence of a	were co-arrested with their male
intimate partner		CJS family incident	child, weapons, alcohol or drug	counterpart. Correlates of co-arrest
violence. Journal of		reports from 2002 only	use, injuries, prior incidents of	included being older.
Interpersonal Violence,		female IPV victims in	abuse and severity of incident.	
21, 1483-1492.		heterosexual	-	
		relationships were		
		studied.		
Muftic, L. R., &	201	70 female and 131 male	Correlational study that	Women were more likely to be
Bouffard, J. A. (2007).		domestic violence	compared male and female	arrested in dual arrest and those
An evaluation of gender		offenders in North	domestic violence offenders	women arrested for dual arrest
differences in the		Dakota. When	attending a Coordinated	were less likely to have a history
implementation and		researchers eliminated	Community Response (CCR)	of DV or any prior arrests
impact of a		same-sex couples, final	program. Authors examined	compared to men.
comprehensive approach		sample was 131 males	implementation, impact on	
to domestic violence.		and 70 females $(N = 201)$	recidivism and studied	
Violence Against		from data collected	demographics, offense	
<i>Women, 13</i> , 46-69 <sup>2</sup> .		between years 2001-	information, prosecution,	
		2003. 87.8% males and	sentencing, and recidivism.	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Also includes interviews (at intake) besides criminal justice records.

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	_	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	
		82.9% females. Males	Data from police and court	
		were more likely to be	reports, besides from a	
		employed than female	community correctional agency.	
		offenders and males had		
		more criminal histories,		
		and were 2 times more		
		likely to have a prior		
		arrest for DV		
Salazar, L., Emshoff, J.,	1476	Arrest rates in 2 counties	Longitudinal Assessment using a	While there were some obstacles
Baker, C., & Crowley,		in GA of spouses, ex-	simple interrupted time series	in the implementation across
T. (2007). Examining	1381	spouses, or IPVs	design with two experimental	counties for CCR, there were
the behavior of a		Two counties in GA were	groups to examine an outcome	significant and sustained increased
system: An outcome		examined pre-and-post	evaluation of Coordinate	arrest rates of males in two of the
evaluation of a		CCR intervention. There	Community Response (CCR).	law enforcement agencies.
coordinated Community		were 1,476 pre-	Arrest data and disposition data	Prosecution rates also increased
response to domestic		intervention arrests and	were collected from both Cherry	following CCR intervention.
violence. Journal of		1,381 post intervention	and Pear counties, and covered	Unintended effects found women
Family Violence, 22,		arrests. For county one	the period from January 1993 (as	in two counties were arrested at
631–641.		pre-intervention data was	far back as could be accessed) to	steady monthly increases
		collected between 1993-	April 1999 (the end of the	following the implementation of
		1996 (45 data points) and	funding period).	CCR.
		post-data 1996-1999 (30		
		data points). For county		
		two pre-data was		
		collected 1993-1997 (49		
		data points) and post-		
		intervention 1997-1999		
		(27 data points)		
Millar, P. & and Brown,	2, 935	Comprised all calls	Archival analysis using police	There were more injuries to
B.(2010) Explaining		identified as being	arrest and charging behavior as	women than men. But when there

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
gender differences in police arresting and charging behavior in cases of spousal violence, <i>Partner Abuse</i> , <i>1</i> , 314-331.		partner abuse cases by the Edmonton Police Service involving heterosexual couples for the years 1999 and 2000 — a rate of 1,468 reports per year or 2.2 cases per 1,000 population per year.	dependent variables. Investigating gender differences and factors likely to affect arrest rates (marital status, intoxication, severity of injury, weapon, repeat calls to police)	were no injuries to a woman, men were 37 times more likely to be charged than women. Minor injuries to a man led to charge a woman 23% of the time while 81% of minor injuries to a woman led a male to be charged. Partners of injured men had a 54% chance of being charged while partners of injured women led men to be charged 90% of the time. There were gender differences in charging and arrest based on injury and weapon use. Use of a weapon by a woman led to an increase in charging by 17 times vs. a 3 times increase if a male uses the same weapon.
Hamilton, M. & Worthen, M. (2011). Sex disparities in arrest outcomes on domestic violence. <i>Journal of Interpersonal Violence</i> 26, 1559-1578.	17, 380	Data obtained from Rhode Island Supreme Court Domestic Violence Training and Monitoring Unit Officers file a complete report for all domestic violence incidents. Data was obtained between 2002-2004. 72% of victims were white and 65% of suspects were	Authors examined dependent variable (arrest or no arrest) and sex differences in arresting the primary aggressor. Independent variables included legal (weapon, injury, protection order) and extra-legal (cohabitant status, drug/ alcohol use, race, ethnicity variables.	Results found more male than female suspects were arrested. Female suspects and arrestees were more likely to have a witness and weapon while male suspects were more likely to have a protection order and previous assault. While both were equal in causing visible injury, police rated female suspects as more hostile than male suspects. Police were .6 times likely to arrest a female for

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
		white.		DV compared to males. Both men and women were more likely to get arrested when there was physical injury, weapon used, or a witness, but when legal factors were present, the probability of being arrested was significantly higher for females than males. The odds of a female arrest increased 1.8 when a she called police compared to a male arrest which reduced their potential for arrest to .6.

# **Ethnographic Study**

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Peacock T., George, L.,	13	Authors began by	The research methods and	Observers witnessed and heard of
Wilson, A. Bergstrom,		arranging to meet with	practices used in this project	instances where, in response to
A., & Pence, E. (2003).		Indigenous women who	incorporate five basic principles	abused women's failure to become
Community-Based		had indicated an interest	that underlie Indigenous	"something they can take and win a
Analysis of the U.S.		in working on the	systems of knowing. These	case with" (Reported in Research
Legal System's		project. They held two	inter-connected and	Team Meeting, December 2000),
Intervention in		long sessions in which	overlapping concepts were	officers criminalized, problematized
Domestic Abuse Cases		they provided	identified in discussions	and/or attempted to intimidate (rather
Involving Indigenous		information and training	between Indigenous members	than protect) the victims. As with the
Women. Final Report		on the institutional	of the research team, and in	dispatchers, several officers
to the National Institute		ethnography method.	conversations between these	problematized Indigenous women

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Studies of Samuela Characteristics Study Type

Pagulta

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
of Justice. Submitted by		Thirteen women from	team members and other	who are the victims of domestic
Mending the Sacred		the community attended	members of their Indigenous	abuse by associating them with
Hoop of Minnesota		the sessions. They were	communities.	alcoholism; one officer actually
Program Development,		women who had been	A methodology based on	distinguished <i>real</i> domestic abuse
Inc. March 2003. 365		abused and had	principles drawn from	from domestic abuse involving
pages <sub>+</sub> bibliography		experience with the legal	Indigenous systems of	parties who have been drinking.
and		process: community	knowledge is complemented by	Officers frequently use institutional
Appendixes.		elders, women	institutional ethnography as a	intimidation in attempts to gain the
		associated with local	method of inquiry.	compliance of problematic abuse
		organizations that had		victims. Observers heard of or saw
		helped with the project's		officers tell abused women that they
		original proposal.		were lying, order them to give a
				statement, accuse them of dealing
				drugs, force them into squad cars,
				threaten to call social services,
				threaten to have their children taken
				from them and threaten to take the
				women to jail. In these reconfigured
				relationships, officers' frustrated
				responsibility for the arrest and
				conviction of domestic abusers not
				only transforms abused women from
				victims to offenders; it also
				sometimes transforms officers from
				women's protectors to their abusers.

### **Victim Satisfaction/Dissatisfaction with Law Enforcement**

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study

Sample Characteristics

Study Type

Results

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
	_	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(run reference)	Size	1	· <b>L</b>	I
(full reference)  Van Hightower, N. & Gorton, J. ((2002). A case study of community-based responses to rural woman battering, Violence Against Women 8, 845-872.	30	The data for this analysis were gathered from intensive interviews with 30 study participants who resided in Birdsall County (a pseudonym). The county was selected as the site for the study because it is designated by the U.S. Census Bureau as a rural area and because it is racially and ethnically diverse. The 2000 population was estimated to be	Intensive interviews, also known as unstructured interviews, refer to a guided conversation that attempts to elicit from the interviewee detailed material that can be used in qualitative analysis.	The interview data suggest that most survivors, five out of eight, were generally dissatisfied with law enforcement interventions. The reasons for not being satisfied included receiving inadequate information about their legal options, insensitivity to their victimization, and accommodations that the police made to batterers. The survivors' most common concern was officers' failure to take action that would have enhanced their protection.  The three women of color who participated in the study were
		16,000 with a density of 18.7 people per square mile (U.S. Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, 2001). Birdsall County is 66.2% white, 24.2% African-American, and 14.7% Hispanic or Latino origin The 1997 median household income was \$23,600. In 1999, 59 cases of domestic violence were referred for prosecution		asked about their perception of race as a factor in their treatment by law enforcement personnel. Although all three women expressed dissatisfaction with police responses to their battering, only one, a 40-year-old African American woman with five children, cited racism as a possible explanation for the unsatisfactory assistance rendered by the police:

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		by the Birdsall County		
		District Attorney's		
		office. Authors		
		conducted intensive		
		interviews with 8		
		women who were		
		survivors of intimate		
		partner violence. The		
		participants were among		
		59 women whose cases		
		were referred to the		
		Birdsall County District		
		Attorney's office during		
		1999. These study		
		participants were		
		selected on the basis of		
		the ability to contact		
		them and on their		
		willingness to be		
		interviewed. Authors		
		interviewed 22 local		
		service providers who		
		could be reasonably		
		expected to intervene on		
		behalf of battered		
		women. From the		
		criminal justice		
		community, they		
		interviewed six Birdsall		
		County law enforcement		

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	_		
				•
		administrators (sheriff,		
		chief deputy sheriff, and		
		four chiefs of police),		
		the Birdsall County		
		District Attorney, the		
		District Attorney's		
		Victim Assistance		
		Coordinator, the		
		Community Corrections		
		Victim Assistance		
		Coordinator, four		
		Justices of the Peace, the		
		local County Judge		
		(misdemeanor criminal		
		cases), and one State		
		District Judge (felony		
		criminal cases). They		
		interviewed seven local		
		service providers who		
		were not criminal justice		
		officials, including three		
		health care providers,		

# Perpetrator Satisfaction/Dissatisfaction with the Criminal Justice System

Guzik, K. (2008). The	30	30 individuals arrested	30-hour semi-structured	The majority of batterers "felt their
agencies of abuse:		and prosecuted in a	interviews with persons arrested	arrest and court encounters were
Intimate abusers'		Midwestern County	and prosecuted for domestic	undeserved and motivated by an
experience of		where police departments	violence used police reports for	unjust legal system." Male

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1a. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies of arrest

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		1		
presumptive arrest and.		have presumptive arrest	severity of violence and CTS2	respondents typically believed
prosecution. Law &		policies. 90% male and		they were victims of gender bias at
Society Review, 4, 111-		10% female batterers.		the hands of individual officers or
143.		56.7% African American,		laws and policies designed to
		36.7% White, 6.7%		protect women. They also
		Latino		interpreted their experiences
				through other, non-privileged
				group identities. African
				Americans participating in this
				study commonly perceived race as
				a factor in police handling of their
				cases. Also suspects expressed
				class-consciousness.

### **Literature Review**

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Hirschel, D. & Buzawa,	50 states	Examined every state in	A meta-analysis (review of	Accompanying the general increase in
E. (2002).		terms of (1) whether had	studies) on dual arrests.	arrests for domestic violence offenses,
Understanding the		mandatory arrest for		the research indicates that there has
context of dual arrest		domestic violence		been an increase in the number of
with directions for		offense, (2) mandatory		cases in which the police have
future research.		arrest for violation of a		arrested both the ongoing victim of
Violence Against		protection order, and (3)		abuse and the batterer after the
Women 8, 1449-14773.		a primary aggressor law.		implementation of a preferred or
				mandatory arrest law, thus raising the
				percentage of females arrested in
				domestic violence cases. After the

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
				state of Washington enacted its
				mandatory arrest law in 1984, dual
				arrests increased to constitute one-
				third of all arrests made for domestic
				violence offenses. Furthermore,
				women were arrested in 50% of all
				cases in Washington in which an
				arrest was made for domestic violence
				More recently, when New York
				enacted its mandatory arrest law in
				1995, dual arrests were reported to
				have had similar increases. Lesbian,
				gay, bisexual, and transgender victims
				of battering may be adversely affected
				to an unfair degree by dual arrests.
				When a domestic violence case
				involves a same-sex couple, it is
				possible that the police are more
				likely to make a dual arrest because
				they cannot use gender to help
				determine the roles of victim and
				aggressor and are therefore more
				likely to inappropriately decide there
				is mutual battering.
				In some jurisdictions, current political
				and/or organizational pressure may
				discourage officers from arresting women as aggressors and, unsure
				what to do, the officers may arrest
				both parties. Hirschel and Buzawa
				both parties. Hirschef and buzawa

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
				argue that dual arrest should not be examined in a vacuum but should instead be placed in a broader context that would (a) take into account both the full range of options that face responding police officers (i.e., arrest one of the parties, both of the parties, or neither of the parties involved in the incident); and (b) compare what occurs in intimate partner violence cases to the police actions taken in other domestic (i.e., siblings, parent/child) and nondomestic incidents

Table 1b. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies on the issuance of protective orders

#### **Studies Based on Official Sources**

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Meloy, R., Cowett, P.,	200	200 subjects were chosen	Correlational/Archival Study	For every race, issuance and
Parker, S., Hofland, B., &		from the San Diego	Some of the variables were:	service of non-mutual protection
Friedland, A. (1997).		County Marshal's office	whether the protection order was	order increased the probability of
Domestic protection		from individuals who	mutual, the order type, the	a victim-related arrest compared
orders and the prediction		were defendants in	criminal arrest records of the	to mutual service or no service at
of subsequent criminality		domestic or civil	defendant three years prior to the	all. For Hispanics, non-mutual
and violence toward		protection-order cases	issuance, violence or nonviolence	service led to a 55% victim-
protectees. Psychotherapy,		from June to August	of the prior criminal record, and	related arrest rate over 3 years,
<i>3</i> , 447-458.		1990.The study consisted	whether the criminal arrest	and mutual service completely
		of 144 males, and 56	involved drugs/ alcohol.	eliminated a subsequent victim-
		females. 114 (57%) were		related arrest. Trends were in the
		Caucasian, 45 (22.5%)		same direction for whites and
		were black, 35 (17.5%)		blacks. The victim-related re-
		were Hispanic, and 6		arrests rate for Hispanics when
		were unknown. Average		there was no service was 10%.
		age of the subjects was		
		38.		
Basile, S. (2005). A measure	378	Examined all cases of	The authors conducted a	The results of this study found sex
of court response to request		DV documented by	correlational study using	was the greatest predictor of whether
for protection. Journal of		Abuse prevention orders	archival data from court	or not a 209A restraining order was
Family Violence, 20, 171-		filed in 1997 in Gardner	records and examined docket	issued and the severity of restrictions
179.		Mass. Examined 406	logs, complaint for a protection	imposed on the defendant. Female
		abuse prevention orders	order, and examined 209A	plaintiff's requests for a protection

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(tun reference)	SIZC		<u> </u>	
		and used 378 cases after accounting for missing data. There were 44 males and 238 females.	restraining orders issued. Independent variables included plaintiff gender, and other attributes of litigants and their relationships (i.e., married, cohabitation, biological children, etc.)	order (PO) were granted 91% of the time compared to male plaintiffs who were granted requests 66% of the time. Men were more than 4 times more likely to have their case deferred (which discourages pursuit of PO). Male requests at 10-day hearing were denied 16% of the time, while female requests were denied 1% of the time. Cases involving female plaintiffs were dismissed or plaintiff vacated 29% of the time, while men were less likely to have their cases dismissed or vacated (19%). Females acquired an abuse prevention order 94% of the time at 10-day hearing compared to 71% of males. Males are 27% less likely to be granted PO at ex parte hearings and 24% less likely at 10-day hearings to be granted a PO compared to female plaintiffs. Men were 360% more likely to have their case deferred than women. Female plaintiffs were 288% more likely to receive custody of children while male plaintiffs got custody 8% of the time compared to 31% for females. Male plaintiffs were 32% less likely

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 1b. Differences in arrest and issuance of protective orders in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic variables: Studies on the issuance of protective orders

Study

Sample | Sample | Characteristics | Study Type | Results

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
Buzawa, E. & Hotaling, G. (2006). The relationship to relationship status, gender, and minor	320	See earlier reference on page 36.	See earlier reference on page 36.	to have a judge order surrender of firearms compared to women. Police were involved 44% of the time when plaintiff was female and involved 22% of the time when plaintiff was male. Judges ordered women evicted 69% of the time and 40% of the time if a biological child were involved and men were evicted 89% of the time and 84% of the time when a biological child was involved.  Males and females were equally likely to be arrested if there was a restraining order violation and when the incident included threats of
status in the police response to domestic assaults" Victims and Offenders: A Journal of Evidence-Based Policies and Practices, 1, 323-360.				injury.
Muftic, L. R.& Bouffard, J. A.(2007). An evaluation of gender differences in the implementation and impact of a comprehensive approach to domestic violence.	201	See earlier reference on page 38.	See earlier reference on page 38.	Females were more likely to receive a no-contact order than males. Females were more likely to be sent to anger management or individual counseling while males were more likely to be sent to DV programs (though there was no DV treatment center for female offenders at the

**Study Type** 

Results

Sample Sample Characteristics

Study

(full reference)	Size	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		
		<u>.</u>		
Violence Against Women, 13, 46-69.				time). Females were more likely to attend intervention programs than men.
Wilcox, P., Jordan, C. E., Pritchard, C. E., & Randa, R. (2008). Rurality-urbansim and protective order service: A research note. <i>Journal of Crime and Justice</i> , 31, 65-86.	120 count ies	Analyses from Kentucky's 120 counties regarding orders of civil protection	Correlational/archival data included KY State police, U.S. Census, U.S. Dept of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics and U.S. Dept of Agriculture County level rate of protection orders issued but not served in 2003. Examined contextual effects on legal case processing Measured population of heterogeneity/instability	Rurality is positively associated with rates of non-service of protection orders. Effects of rurality appear mediated by an SES index presumed to tap resource deprivation.
Muller, H. J., Desmarais, S. L., Hamel, J. M. (2009). Do judicial responses to restraining order requests discriminate against male victims of domestic violence? <i>Journal of Family Violence</i> , 24, 625-637.	157	227 Case files of DV TRO petitions were randomly selected from Sacremento, CA District Court 157 case files were used for analyses	Archival/Correlational Study that examined whether there were gender differences in TRO's granted or denied and whether level of violence differed by gender or interacted with issuance of TRO.	Judges granted 88% of TRO requests. The majority of cases were low-moderate levels of violence. Severity of violence did not differ by plaintiff gender. Regression analyses found plaintiff sex accounted for 25% of the variance in court decisions. Judges were almost 13 times more likely to issue a TRO to a female plaintiff compared to a male plaintiff. TRO's were granted to those with more severe violence. Male plaintiffs requesting TRO's with low levels of violence were less likely to be granted a TRO

Study reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
				compared to female plaintiffs with low level violence.

### **Interviews**

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(Full Reference)	Size			
Ammar, N, Orloff, L., Dutton, M, & Aguilar- Hass, G. (2005). Calls to police and police response: A case study of Latina immigrant women in the USA. International Journal of Police Science and	230	See earlier reference on page 11.	See earlier reference on page 11.	The single most significant factor contributing to a decision by the police to make an arrest was whether the battered immigrant Latina woman had a protection order at the time of the call. Nearly one-third of respondents in the study, 32.7 percent (n = 17), reported having a protection order in effect when they
Management, 7, 230- 244.				called police. Police were more likely to make an arrest when the victims reported having a protection order (50 %vs. 20.7 %).

Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study	N	Sample Size	Study Type-Large Scale Studies	Results
(full reference)		and Characteristics	<b>Using Police and Court Data</b>	
Belknap, J. & Graham,	2,670	Chapter 2 in report	Data for the study were collected	The gender differences between
D. (2000). Factors		presents findings on	from a variety of the key actors	the male and female defendants
Related to Domestic	63	2,670 cases, compiling	and sources: Pre-Trial Services	did not appear very pronounced.
Violence Court		data from pretrial	Files and data; (2) detailed	The defendant's sex was only
Dispositions in a Large		services, police reports	interviews and surveys of	related to the case outcome once:
Urban Area: The Role of		and NIBRS reports, and	prosecutors, judges, and public	Male defendants received more
Victim/Witness		a form designed for use	defenders interviews; (3) intensive	days sentenced to incarceration
Reluctance and Other		in this study that was	content analysis of court	than their female counterparts.
Variables,		completed by	transcripts; and (4) detailed	Various offender characteristics
Final Report		prosecutors. Chapter 3	interviews and surveys of	which were raised during the
257 pages		describes the method	domestic violence victims. Data	course of the court hearing. The
		and findings from	relevant to bias in prosecution	defendant's SES was raised in ten
		intensive interviews and	tended to be from court transcripts.	percent of the cases and the
		surveys with 14 judges,		defendant's employment was
		18 prosecutors, and 31		raised in two-fifths of the cases.
		public defenders that		Regarding gender differences
		process these cases.		between the male defendant and
		Chapter 4 reports the		female defendant cases, in the
		findings from intensive		male defendant cases the victims
		content analysis of 127		were more likely to have their
		court cases, and Chapter		drinking and employment raised
		5 is a detailed report of		during the court case and the
		the method and findings		defendants were more likely to
		from interviewing and		have their SES and employment
		surveying over 100		raised. Notably, in the cases
		battered women who		where the informal or formal

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		were in this process.		abuse history was raised, for
		Over four-fifths of the		cases with female defendants, this
		defendants in the sample		prior abuse was typically how the
		were male, and over		person viewed as the victim in the
		four-fifths of the victims		current case had been the abuser
		were female. About 86		
		percent of the cases		in prior violent incidences. The gender differences in
		were male defendants		prosecutorial actions indicate that
		and female victims and		1 -
				prosecutors are more likely to
		14 percent were females		request text stricken in female defendant (than male defendant)
		charged with abusing their intimate male		,
				cases, and less likely to have an
		partners. Fewer than two		opening statement. The
		percent of the sample		prosecutors also appeared to be
		was same-sex partners.		better prepared for the male than
		Similar to many other		the female victims. Moreover,
		studies and jurisdictions,		the judge was more likely to rule
		African Americans were		on the defendants' side for female
		grossly over-represented		than male defendants when the
		in the court sample		defender had objected to the
		compared to the		victim's testimony. Rule 29 was
		population. Over		raised more often in male- than
		seventy percent of those		female-defendant cases.
		charged with domestic		
		violence were African		
		Americans, and about		
		seventy percent of the		
		victims were African		
		Americans. Almost all		
		of the remaining		

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
	<u> </u>			I
		defendants and victims		
		were white. The		
		defendants' ages ranged		
		from 17 to well into		
		their eighties, with the		
		average age in the early		
		thirties. The victims		
		ranged in age from 14 to		
		one woman in her		
		eighties. The average		
		age for victims was		
		almost thirty years old.		
Kingsnorth, R.	1,427	Analysis relies on a data	Domestic violence cases processed	Cases involving Latino victims
MacIntosh, R.,		set of 1427 domestic	through the Sacramento County	are less likely to experience
Sutherland, S. (2002).		violence cases processed	District Attorney's Office The	criminal prosecution at intake
Criminal charge or		through the Sacramento	authors apply multinomial	than cases involving white (non-
probation violation?		County District	regression to prosecutorial	Latino) victims. However, model
Prosecutorial discretion		Attorney's Office	decision making and ordinary least	2 (where cases "rejected" and
and implications for		between July 1st and	squares to sentence length.	processed as probation violations
research in criminal		November 1st, 1999,		are not treated as attrition, but
court processing.		and it represents the		more properly grouped with
Criminology, 40, 553-		total number of cases		criminal filings) fails to confirm
577.		disposed during that		the role of ethnicity in prosecutor
		period.		decision making. Prosecutors do
				not see victimization of Latinos
				as a less serious offense than
				victimization of whites. Suspect
				gender attains moderate
				significance in relation to
				processing as a VOP (violation of

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Henning, K. & Feder, L. (2005) Criminal prosecution of domestic violence offenses: An investigation of factors predictive of court outcomes. Criminal Justice and Behavior, 32, 612-642.	4,178	Using a sample of 4,178 defendants arrested for a misdemeanor or felony domestic violence offense. 82.1% of the sample was African-American and only 2.0% were of another minority racial group. Defendant's mean age was 32.3 (9.5 SD). 20. % of defendant's were female. 38.1 % of defendants were unemployed, and their estimated income in thousands was 22.6 (12.9 SD).	Court records for a 12-month period starting in August 2000 were obtained on all criminal defendants arrested for a domestic offense in Shelby County, Tennessee. Shelby County has a population of roughly 800,000 and the county's court system has jurisdiction over the city of Memphis and the surrounding unincorporated areas.	probation), but not in any of the models, which include cases filed on criminal charges. Suspect gender does not attain significance in relation to any outcome measures at intake, but appears to increase the likelihood of processing of male offenders as VOPs. Suspect gender and victim race appear to be unrelated to sentencing in this study.  Male defendants were more likely (p < .05) than female defendants to have their cases transferred out of the Domestic Violence Court (15.0% vs. 10.9%). Of particular note are findings that minority defendants (98% African American) were less likely to be granted a ROR release and were less likely to have their cases declined by prosecutors in comparison to white defendants. Also gender was significantly associated with pretrial release, prosecution, and sentencing decisions. That is, female defendants were more likely to be released ROR, to have their charges dropped by prosecutors

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(tun reference)	BIZC		<u> </u>	<u> </u>
				,were less likely to be prosecuted, were less likely to plead or be found guilty, and when found guilty, were less likely to be incarcerated in comparison to their male counterparts. The researchers used logistic regression to address concerns for multicollinearity. Also, prosecutors were more likely to drop a case if the defendant was white, older, and from a higher SES. Extralegal variables like the defendant's gender and income independently predicted the use of cash bonds as opposed to offenders being released on ROR. The results suggest that gender is a significant predictor of the decisions made throughout the adjudication process. These differences persisted even when other legal and extralegal variables were controlled
Henning, K. & Renauer,	4,178	4,178 domestic violence	Court records for 1 year period	Female defendants arrested for
B. (2005). Prosecution		cases with disposition	starting in August 2000 on all	offending against a male intimate
of women arrested for		information from the	criminal defendants arrested for a	partner were treated more
intimate partner abuse		local Domestic Violence	domestic offense in Shelby county,	leniently than male defendants
Violence and Victims,		Court. Three types of	Tennessee.	and women arrested for domestic
20, 361-376		cases were extracted		offenses (DV) involving other

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		from larger database: (1)		types of relationships (i.e.,
		all women (576) who		familial, homosexual). Almost
		were arrested for a		one half (47%) of the cases
		misdemeanor or felony		involving women arrested for DV
		domestic offense		against a heterosexual intimate
		involving an HIP		partner were rejected by
		(heterosexual intimate		prosecutors; another 16% were
		partner); (2) all of the		dismissed by a judge.
		men arrested for HIP		Prosecutors were much more
		offenses (2,704); (3)		likely to pursue charges against
		women whose alleged		men (85.1%) compared to women
		victim was either a		(53.5% (chi square =292.8, p <
		female intimate partner		.001). A simultaneous logistic
		(78), a male non-		regression analysis showed that
		intimate (43), or a		HIP cases involving female
		female non-intimate		defendants were still less likely to
		(148). 82.1% of the		be prosecuted than those
		people arrested for		involving men, even while
		domestic violence		controlling for other factors that
		during the study year		differed between the two groups
		were African American		(e.g., prior criminal arrests). The
		and only 2.0% were		study also found that a woman's
		another minority racial		race independently predicted
		group.		whether she was prosecuted for
				an offense against an HIP.
				Compared to cases involving
				whites, prosecutors were more
				likely to pursue charges against
				minority defendants (mostly
				African-American in this study).

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(tun reference)	Size			
Kingsnorth, R. & MacIntosh, R. (2007).  "Intimate partner violence: The role of suspect gender in prosecutorial decision-making." <i>Justice Quarterly</i> , 24, 460-495.	7,261	The data set for this study consists of 8,461 cases processed through the domestic Violence Unit between July 1, 1999, and December 18, 2001. Since some arrestees were rearrested during the study period (range = 1-7 new arrests), these 8,461 cases were contributed by 7,261 individuals.	The authors identified four dependent variables for analysis. First, they examine the prosecutor's decision to file a case for further action versus rejected by reason of insufficient evidence. Second, they analyze the decision to file felony versus non- felony charges. Third, they examine the decision to dismiss the case for insufficient evidence. Fourth, among those cases fully prosecuted, authors analyzed the decision to reduce felony charges to a misdemeanor or probation violation.	Judged by the change in outcome probabilities; gender ranks as one of the most influential variables on the decisions to file, dismiss; and reduce charges in the combined models used in the study. This influence expresses itself through a substantial number of interactions which would have remained undetected had the authors not presented separate analyses for male and female defendants. Another consistent pattern among the offense severity variables is that three of the four coefficient comparisons show that the victim's need for medical attention is evaluated differently by prosecutors according to the perpetrator's gender.
Smith, E. & Farole, D.J. (2009). Profile of intimate partner violence cases in large urban counties. Bureau of Justice Statistics Special Report. U.S. Department of Justice.	3,750	In the state courts of 16 large urban counties,3,750 cases of intimate partner violence (IPV) were filed in May 2002. These cases represent 83% of the 4,562 domestic violence cases filed in the 16 counties.	Findings are based on information documented in prosecutor files and court records of 3,750 intimate partner violence cases.  Cases were tracked for one year following the defendant's first court appearance in May 2002.	When there was a male defendant and female victim, the defendant was charged with a felony 19% of the cases and a misdemeanor in 80.9% of the cases. In cases with female defendants and male victims, the defendant was charged with a felony in 14.5% of the cases and a misdemeanor in 85.5% of the cases, and when the defendant and victim were of the same gender, the

Study	Sample	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size		
			defendant was charged with a
			felony in 16.4% of the cases and a
			misdemeanor in 83.6% of the
			cases. Male defendants were
			convicted 59.8% (9.9% in felony
			and 48.5% in misdemeanor,
			compared to female defendants
			40.3% (4.9% in felony and 33.6%
			in misdemeanor cases) and
			defendants with victims of the
			same gender 43.7% (5.6% in
			felony and 37.3%). For male
			defendants there was a
			dismissal/nolle prosequi/ acquittal
			in 32.6% of the cases, for female
			defendants 43.7% and 44.4% for
			defendants with victims of the
			same gender. For male
			defendants pretrial diversion or
			deferred
			adjudication occurred in 7.7% of
			the cases, for female defendants
			in 16% of the cases, and for
			defendants with victims of the
			same gender 12%. When males
			were convicted they received a
			prison sentence in 7.5% of cases,
			a jail sentence in 76.2% of cases,
			and probation in 16.3% of cases.
			Comparative figures for female

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
				defendants convicted were 5.0%, 65.8%, and 29.2%. Finally, for defendants with victims of the same gender, the comparative figures were 10.9%, 67.3%, and 21.8%.

Study (full reference)	N	Sample Size and Characteristics	Study Type—Small Scale Studies Using Police and	Results
(run reference)		and Characteristics	Court Data	
Rauma, D. (1984). Going for the gold: Prosecutorial decision making in cases of wife assault. Social Science Research, 13, 321-351.	199	199 cases forwarded to the Santa Barbara District Attorney's Office. Only cases with female victim and male offender and only past or present heterosexual romantic or conjugal relationships. Sample size diminishes for each decision point: to follow up a case, to file charges, and to divert.	Quantitative study using only cases recorded on incident or arrest reports are included.	Found that if female victim had negative character (measured by offender alleging her to be violent or by police to have been drinking), the probability of following up the case decreased by .37, while if the male had negative character (a temporary restraining order in effect, a weapon present, verbally or physically abusive to police) increased the probability of the case being followed up by .5. There was also a positive effect (but not significant) of the case being followed up if the couple was nonwhite. Each additional negative aspect of the female victim's character increases the probability of diversion by about

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

criminal justice system). However, a

lack of significant effect of race on

Study	Sam	ple	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size				
Cramer, E. (1999). Variables that predict verdicts in domestic violence cases. Journal of Interpersonal Violence, 14, 1137- 1150.	140	find Construction of the C	a stratified disproportionate luster sampling of 560 case cles (made available by the Chesterfield County, Virginia pecial prosecutor) was used to andomly select 140 cases for the study. There were 110 (78.6%) male and 30 (21.4%) emale perpetrators. Of these 8 (34.3%) were Africantamerican, 86 (61.4%) white, and 5 (3.6%) Hispanic.	Quantitative study using case files with domestic violence related charges were made available by the special domestic violence prosecutor.  Police records and narrative	.83, while each negative aspect of the offender's character decreases the likelihood of counseling by .58. Race had no effect on the diversion decision.  Male perpetrators more often received guilty sentences than female perpetrators (but not due to "primary aggressor" policy in dual arrest situations, because that policy had not yet been implemented). Also white males were more likely to receive guilty sentences than men of color.
Bui, H.N. (2001). Domestic violence victims' behavior in favor of prosecution: Effects of gender relations. Women & Criminal Justice, 12, 51-76.	124	o v A d 1 A w v	A systematic random selection of 15 percent of intimate iolence cases reported to the arlington Police Department uring the first six months of 1997 resulted in 126 cases. After excluding two cases in which race/ethnicity of the ictims was classified as 1997 other," the final sample was 1997 cases. Fifty-eight percent	reports of police responses to domestic violence calls in the City of Arlington, a metropolitan area with a population of 300,000 in North Texas.	Hispanic and African American women were significantly more likely than white women to desire prosecution. In the multivariate analysis, being Hispanic significantly increased the likelihood of prosecution. Mutual charge and victim's arrest had negative impact on victim's behavior in favor of prosecution (according to the author because women have lost trust in the

were white, 27 percent were

African American, and 15

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

2	1			
Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			

Dawson, M., & Dinovitzer, R. (2001). Victim cooperation and the prosecution of domestic violence in a specialized court. <i>Justice Quarterly</i> , 18, 593-622.	60	The researchers tracked a total of 474 cases during that one-year period, reflecting all police-laid domestic assault and related charges brought to specialized domestic violence court in Toronto, Canada, and completed during the evaluation period. Because it proved extremely difficult and time-consuming to find participants, and to arrange and hold the interviews, only 60	The data for this study were gathered from the files of a specialized domestic violence court in Toronto, Canada. Prosecution files, that included police investigation reports, were supplemented by files kept by the Victim/Witness Assistance Program (VWAP). In addition, the authors conducted interviews with victims who were	victims' behavior cast doubt, at least with regard to the situation of domestic violence victims, on prior claims that minority status causes distrust of the criminal justice system.  Male defendants are more likely to be prosecuted than female defendants when examining relationship between severity of offense and decision to prosecute, even when controlling for victim and offender relationship, the presence of other types of evidence, and victim cooperation.
		hold the interviews, only 60 such interviews were conducted; these represent less	with victims who were prepared to participate in the evaluation. Although low	
		than 15 percent of the total sample. 91% of victims were female, while 93% of offenders were male. The average age of	response rate prevents them from drawing conclusions from the qualitative data, they use victims' comments	
		the victim was 33 years and the average age of the offender was 35 years.	for illustration.	
Hirschel, D. &	424	The final sample included 424	Of the total 686 cases	While in the bivariate analysis,
Hutchison I.		cases in Charlotte, North	processed by the Charlotte	African-American defendants were

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study	Samp		Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	<b>F</b>		
,	<u> </u>			
(2001). The relative effects of offender, offense, and victim variables on the decision to prosecute domestic violence cases. Violence Against Women. 7, 46-59.		Carolina, all of which involved female victims and male offenders and were 18 and older. 295 (69.6%) of offenders were black and 120 (28.9%) were white.	Police Dept. in the Charlotte (SARP) experiment, 271 involved arrest of the offender and 181 involved issuance of a citation to the offender. These offenders were tracked through the local criminal justice system by a court official utilizing the computerized county criminal justice records information system. Study focused on middle range of misdemeanant cases and excluded the more serious felony offenses.	more likely than white defendants to have their cases result in a prosecution, but the relationship did not reach the .05 level of statistical significance. There was no relationship between victim injury (which was correlated to decision to prosecute) and race. Employment status had no relationship to decision to prosecute.
Kingsnorth, R. MacIntosh, R., Berdahl, T., Blades, C., & Rossi, S. (2001). Court processing domestic violence: The role of interracial/ethnic dyads in criminal court processing.  Journal of Contemporary Criminal Justice, 17, 123-141.	455	A random sample of 455 cases was selected from 4281 cases received and processed by the District Attorney's Office in Sacramento County. There were 166 cases of whites assaulting whites (37% of cases), 116 of blacks assaulting blacks (26% of cases), 21 of Hispanics assaulting whites (5%), 40 of Hispanics assaulting Hispanics assaulting Hispanics (9%), 31 of blacks assaulting whites (7%), and 81 other cases	Data sources for coding the cases included: law enforcement arrest and crime reports, the D.A.'s information, the probation officer's pre-sentence investigation report, the	They did not find that intra-race and intra-ethnic violence was treated by official decision makers as less worthy of condemnation and punishment than inter-race and interethnic violence. The multivariate analysis found that there is no significant difference between any of the interracial/ethnic dyads with respect to any of the five outcome measures examined: (1) decision to file charges; (2) decision to file cases as felonies as versus misdemeanors; (3) decision to fully

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			

		(18%).		prosecute versus case dismissal; (4)
				whether a case was convicted on
				felony or misdemeanor charges; and
A T 0	0.2		A 1. 1	(5) the length of sentence imposed.
Ames, L. &	83	Case studies based primarily	Archival case studies	Many of the men noted in this article benefited from the system's
Dunham, K. (2002).		review of 83 probation files, on	The authors worked with	unwillingness or inability to give harsh
Asymptotic justice:	24	court observations, and on	the probation department,	sentences to abusers.
Probation as a		victim interviews $(n = 24)$ to	the defense attorney's office,	sentences to abusers.
criminal justice		examine the utility of;	and the local advocacy	
response to intimate		probation.	organization in evaluating	
partner violence.			their programs in Clinton	
Violence Against			County, New York, for more	
<i>Women</i> , 8, 6-34.	100	TD 1 C 1 '	than a year.	
Davis, R., Smith,	190	Two samples of case records in	Information on each case	Defendant's gender remained one of
B., & Taylor, B.	157	Milwaukee were drawn two	collected from prosecutor	the best predictors of prosecution
(2003). Increasing	157	periods, one drawn from the	files—initial appearance,	after new charging policy; with male
the proportion of domestic violence		period immediately prior to	disposition, sentencing dates,	defendants more likely to be
		change in district attorney	charges, charge reduction,	prosecuted than female defendants.
arrests that are		charging policy on Jan. 1, 1995	etc. From court computer collected information on	
prosecuted: A		and one representative of the		
natural experiment in Milwaukee.		period immediately after. The	previous arrests of defendant	
		baseline court sample (n=190)	and subsequent arrests from	
Criminology &		comprised every other domestic violence case with	time of case filing to time of disposition.	
<i>Public Policy</i> , 2, 263-282.		initial pretrial hearings held	disposition.	
203-202.		during Oct., Nov., and Dec. of		
		1994. The baseline <i>nolle</i>		
		sample (n=157) consisted of		
		every other domestic violence		
		arrest that the prosecutor		
		arrest mat me prosecutor		

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study Sample Sample Characteristics Study Type Results

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Dawson, M., (2003) The cost of 'lost' intimacy: The effect of relationship state on criminal justice decision making. British Journal of Criminology, 43, 689-709.	144 T	declined to prosecute during Oct., Nov., and Dec. of 1994. The post change court sample consisted of every third case scheduled for an initial pretrial nearing during Feb., March, and April of 1995, which included 242 cases. The post change nolle sample consisted of 155 domestic violence arrests (every other declined case) that the prosecutor declined to prosecute during Feb., March, and April of 1995. 93% of the defendants in the samples were male. The total number of intimate partner homicides that occurred in Toronto, Ontario, from 1974-96 that resulted in conviction. Just includes male offenders and female victims who had been legal spouses, common-law partners, or in a poyfriend/ girlfriend relationship.	Official statistics from court decisions.	Results demonstrate that offenders who kill estranged partners are treated more severely than those who kill current partners. However, when legal factors are introduced, separation killers are no longer treated differently than intact killers at the conviction stage. Separation killers received significantly longer sentences than intact killers (in all five models). Separation killers were more likely to be charged with first degree murder than intact killers. The older the defendant, the less

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			

Worrall, J., Ross, J., McCord. E. (2006). Modeling prosecutors' charging decisions in domestic violence cases. Crime and Delinquency, 52, 472-503.	245	Data from 245 crime reports (representing all of the domestic violence reports filed in 2003) provided by a municipal police department in a Southern California city with a population of approximately 75,000 After excluding mutual assault cases, the average age of the victim was 31.7 and of the suspect was 32.4. There were 167 (21.96%) female victims and 47 (78.04%) male victims; and 46 (21.40%) female suspects and 169 (78.60%) male suspects.136 (75.98%) nonwhite victims and 43 (24.02%) white victims; and 161 (75.23%) nonwhite suspects and 53 (24.77%) white suspects.	Police reports. It is important to point out that police officers are required, as part of completing their crime reports, to name primary and secondary counts, relevant code sections, and whether they feel the case should be processed as a felony or misdemeanor. When the case is sent to the prosecutor's office, it can be accepted or rejected for prosecution. In addition, the prosecutor has the discretion to go forward with the police officer's recommendations or opt for misdemeanor instead of felony charges. The authors did not explore whether and how often prosecutors go with police officers' recommendations. They used a logistic regression model in their analysis.	likely he will be convicted of first-degree or second degree murder.  Victim sex and suspect sex were not independent of the charging decision. Bivariate analyses suggest that cases with female as opposed to male victims are more likely to result in charges. Likewise, charges were more likely to be pursued against male as opposed to female suspects. (The effect of victim and/or suspect sex on the charging decision has been ignored in previous studies, given their restrictive definitions of domestic violence.) Also results of the logistic model found that cases with female victims were more likely to result in criminal charges and when the suspect was male, charges were more likely. Age and race of the victim or suspect was not related to charging decision. All these findings excluded mutual assaults. In regard to the decision to file misdemeanor instead of felony charges, victim and suspect sex lost their significance, but only slightly. Cases with white victims were much more likely to be prosecuted as misdemeanors,
--	-----	---	---	--

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

2				
Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			

				although the suspect race variable was not significant.
Muftic, L. & Bouffard, J. (2007). An evaluation of gender differences in the implementation and impact of a comprehensive approach to domestic violence. Violence Against Women, 13, 46-69 <sup>1</sup> .	201	70 female and 131 male domestic violence offenders in North Dakota.  When eliminated same-sex couples, final sample was 131 males and 70 females (N = 201) from data collected between the years 2001-2003. 87.8% males and 82.9% females. Males were more likely to be employed than female offenders and males had more criminal histories, and were 2 times more likely to have a prior arrest for domestic violence.	Correlational study that compared male and female domestic violence offenders attending a Coordinated Community Response (CCR) program. Authors examined implementation, impact on recidivism and studied demographics, offense information, prosecution, sentencing, and recidivism.	Men were charged with criminal assault and more serious charges than women. Females received more deferred sentences than males.

Study	N	Sample Size	Study Type-Large Scale	Results
(full reference)		and Characteristics	Survey/Interview Study	
Felson, R. & Pare,	16,000	The survey is based on data	Analyses are based on	In general, the evidence does not
P. (2007). Does the		collected in 1994–1996 from a	incidents of physical and	support the idea that the response of
criminal justice		nationally representative sample	sexual assaults reported to	the courts depends on the gender of
system treat		of 8,000 women and 8,000 men,	the police in the National	the offender or victim. The courts are
domestic violence		age 18 and over. A computer-	Survey of Violence Against	no more likely to convict male or
and sexual assault		assisted telephone interview	Women (and Men).	female offenders, or offenders who
offenders leniently?		was conducted with each		victimize men or women. While they

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Also includes interviews (at intake) besides criminal justice records.

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
Justice Quarterly, 24, 435-459.	in ex	spondent that included formation about their speriences with violence as an lult.		found that the courts are more likely to incarcerate male offenders than female offenders, this may reflect the fact that men are more likely to have criminal records while women are more likely to have family obligations. Finally, they found no evidence that offenders are treated more leniently when they assault women who have engaged in deviant conduct during the incident. The evidence does not support the notion that the criminal justice system withdraws chivalrous treatment when female victims have violated gender roles.

Study	N	Sample Size	Study Type-Interview	Results
(full reference)		and Characteristics	Studies	
Lyon, E. (2002)	60	Interviews were completed with	In-depth interviews with 60	It was striking that the interviews
Special Session		60 women whose partners had	women. The questions	revealed only one account of different
Domestic Violence		been arrested for family	were designed to elicit	treatment by court personnel that was
Courts: Enhanced		violence crimes and were being	information from women	attributed to racial or ethnic bias.
Advocacy and		seen in one of the three special	about the meaning and	Instead, when women reported that
Interventions, Final		session sites Unfortunately,	context of intimate	they had been treated unfairly, they
Report. (October)		the sampling goal of 20 whites,	violence in their lives	pointed to having been arrested or not
116 pages		20 African-Americans and 20	generally; their	heard. In fact, white women were
		Latinas was not achieved	assessments of the risks	more likely than others to say they had

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study	Sampl		Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	_		
		precisely. Instead, the	and options available to	not been fairly treated. It is certainly
		interviews included 22 whites,	them and their children	possible that women did not feel they
		25 African-Americans, and 11	from family, friends and	were treated unfairly because of race
		Latinas, along with a Native	other institutions; their	or ethnicity; it is also possible that
		American woman and a woman	strategies for maximizing	women of color who felt they had
		who had emigrated from India.	safety for themselves and	been unfairly treated on racial or
			their children; the meaning	ethnic grounds were less likely than
			of the arrest incident in	others to participate in interviews.
			their overall experience of	
			their relationship with their	
			abusive partner; and,	
			significantly, the impact of	
			the court experience (its	
			options and remedies; their	
			contact with advocates and	
			court and offender	
			intervention staff) on their	
			plans, sense of options, and	
			understanding of the abuse	
			they had experienced.	
Guzik, K. (2008)		In-depth interviews with 30	Hour long semi-structured	Male respondents typically believed
The agencies of		persons arrested and prosecuted	in-depth interviews.	they were victims of gender bias at the
abuse: intimate		for domestic violence in		hands of individual officers or laws
abusers' experience		Centralia County, a Midwestern		and policies designed to protect
of presumptive		county, home to a large state		women. They also interpreted their
arrest and		university and three small cities	,	experiences through other, non-
prosecution.		which has a presumptive arrest		privileged group identities. African
Law & Society		and presumptive prosecution		Americans participating in this study
<u>Review</u> , 42, 111-		policy. Twenty-seven were		commonly perceived race as a factor
143.		male; otherwise heterogeneous		in police handling of their cases. Also

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socio-economic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
	sta	terms of age, race, marital atus, employment, and iminal history.		suspects expressed a certain type of class-consciousness.

Study	N	Sample Size	Study Type—Victim	Results
(full reference)		and Characteristics	Attitude Study	
Buzawa, E.,	353	The study sample consists of	Multiple data sources.	Victims (all females) perceived a gap
Hotaling, G, Klein,		353 cases of male-to-female	Data sources utilized to	between their interests and those of
A., Byrne J. (1999)		domestic violence that took	create this integrated data	the prosecutors. How wide was this
Response to		place during a 7 month data	base included: (1) criminal	gap, and why did it exist? To some
Domestic Violence		collection period (June, 1995	history data, (2) civil	extent, it started with differential
in a Pro-Active		through February, 1996) in the	restraining order data, (3)	expectations about the need for the
Court Setting –		Quincy District Court,	batterer treatment program	criminal justice system's continued
Final Report			data, (4) police incident	involvement with the victim: The
National Institute of			reports, (5) prosecutorial	majority was either ambivalent or
Justice. 177 pages.			data (6) court data, (7)	opposed to even talking to the
			victim survey data, and (8)	prosecutor about their cases. This
			batterer survey data.	opposition was related to differences
				between a full enforcement policy and
				victim preferences which included
				37% of victims wanting charges
				dropped or the case not go forward,
				and an additional 14% wanting
				charges lowered. While most victims
				stated that prosecutors increased their
				safety, in about 9% of the cases,
				victims felt that contact with the
				prosecutor jeopardized their

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			

			safety.65% of victims were satisfied and 34% dissatisfied with prosecutor's actions.
Gillis, J. R., Diamond, S. L., Jebely, P., Orekhovsky, V., Ostovich, V. MacIsaac, K., Sagrati, S., & Mandell, D. (2006). Systemic obstacles to battered women's participation in the judicial system: When will the status quo change? Violence Against Women, 12, 1150-1168	the Canadian lesystem. Participants either white or (45%) or India percentages of identified as W. Chinese, Native mixed race/ett majority of wo participants we generation imm. Canada, and 25 participants we see the canada	research assistants facilitated all focus grows discussion were one victim on in Ontario and verse group of ticipants ranged to 54 years, with of 39. Most f-identified as Caucasian (25%). Smaller women selfwomen of color or first-nigrants to item of focus groups were er focus groups  research assistants facilitated all focus grows accilitated all focus grows facilitated all focus grows facilitated all focus grows accilitated all focus grows accil	proceedings were described by participants as intimidating, impersonal, and demeaning. Court officials demonstrated little empathy and often treated women as "case files." All women in the present studies reported that they would never use the legal system again in domestic violence situations. The present studies corroborates previous findings that women survivors of violence continues, to face difficulties in the legal-judicies system that impair its usefulness as a resource for their protection. The present study also indicates that women who complete the prosecution process are often disappointed with court outcomes, which do not correspond with the severity and repercussions of their partner's

PASK#12 Online Tables - Table 2a. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socioeconomic categories: Studies of prosecution

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
	p	articipants, with an average	of	
	4	participants in each group.		
	T	hree focus groups consisted	of	
	w	omen who had followed		
	th	nrough with the entire proces	SS	
	0:	f prosecuting their partner,		
		nd the other three groups		
		ncluded women who had at		
	so	ome point withdrawn from the	he	
		rosecution process.		

Table 2b. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socio-demographic categories: Jury decision-making

Study	N	Sample	Study TypeExperimental	Results
(full reference)		Characteristics	Research	
Finkel, N. J., Meister, K. H., & Lightfoot, D. M. (1991). The self-defense defense and community sentiment. Law and Human Behavior 15, 585-682.	269	269 participants including a group of undergraduate students (n = 107, 41 males and 66 females) with a mean age of 20 and a group of nonstudent adults (n = 162, 75 males and 87 females) mean age of 42.	Experimental design that used death qualified mock jurors to examine three cases: a battered woman who kills, a case where a female kills a male on the subway, and an alleged rape victim who kills her rapist. Independent variables included expert testimony (no expert, battered woman syndrome, rape trauma syndrome, and PTSD). Weapon and threat scenarios were also manipulated.	No gender differences found in verdict decisions, but adults were more likely to choose verdict of self-defense compared to students.
Kasian, M., Spanos, N., Terrance, C., & Peebles, S. (1993). Battered women who kill. Jury simulation and legal defenses. <i>Law and Human Behavior</i> , <i>17</i> , 289-312.	606	Both experiments included college students. Experiment one consisted of first-year psychology students. Ranged in age from 17-70. A total of 103 females and 134 males.	Experimental study (mixed model) assesses acquittal rates using mock jurors in cases involving a battered woman charged with killing her husband. Type of plea (automatism, psychological self-defense and self-defense) and expert testimony was manipulated. Pre-	Study one found the defendant was more likely to be found guilty when she pled self-defense compared to automatism and expert testimony altered verdicts wherein males changed a guilty verdict to a not guilty verdict, whereas females changed a not guilty verdict to a guilty verdict over the course of

PASK#12.Online Tables – Table 2b. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socio-demographic categories: Jury decision-making

Study

Sample Sample Characteristics

Study Type

Results

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	_		
		Experiment two included 369 participants (233 females and 136 males) from introductory psychology classes. In both studies, juries comprised between 5-8 participants in order to form a total of 40 juries per condition and deliberated to a verdict.	post deliberation assessments of verdict and guilt were assessed in both studies.	deliberations. Females also rated guilt lower than males and participants found the defendant in the self-defense condition more credible than in the automatism condition. Jurors were more likely to find a defendant guilty, despite the use of expert testimony on the battered woman's syndrome
Stalans, L. & Lurigio, A. (1995). Public preferences for the court's handling of domes-tic violence situations. <i>Crime &amp; Delinquency</i> , 41, 399-413.	260	Adult residents in Georgia, drawn from the jury pool of the Fulton County Court. The sample consisted of 58.2% women, 40.2% African Americans, and 56.6% white, ranging in age from 19 to 90 years $(M = 38.3)$ .	Respondents read a short scenario and imagined that the events were actually happening to them. Eight versions of this scenario were created by manipulating three factors; whether the spouse intended to harm the respondent (unintentional: "You fall and hit a table" versus intentional: "Your spouse strikes you across the face several times"); whether the victim received injuries ("You have bruises to the face and a bleeding lip"); and whether the	Data suggests important gender and victimization differences in preferences. Compared to men, women preferred restraining orders and guilty verdicts, with counseling and jail time. Most women wanted the court to protect them, to hold their partners accountable, and to treat as well as punish their partners. Women with young children desired mediation more when they loved their partners and wanted to maintain harmony in their relationships, whereas women

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
			victim received injuries in past disputes. Respondents were instructed to "assume that the police placed your spouse under arrest for domestic violence. How would you prefer the court to handle the matter?" Respondents expressed their preferences for the seven alternatives, using a 1-to-7 scale, where 1 is equal to "do not prefer at all" and 7 is equal to "completely prefer."	without children wanted mediation more to maintain their status in the community. Men were less likely to seek protection orders or to prefer spouse accountability, and they preferred mediation in situations involving physical injuries because they thought mediation would favor their position over their partners'.
Schuller, R. A. and Hastings, P. A. (1996). Trials of battered women who kill: The impact of alternative forms of expert evidence. <i>Law and Human Behavior</i> , 20, 167-187.	195	Participants included York University jury eligible students (N = 195) mean age = 23, and non-university students (N = 202) with a mean age of 31.	Experimental research that used the Lavallee v. Regina (1990) case transcript as stimulus materials and manipulated response history (active or passive history of violence), expert testimony type (social agency, battered woman syndrome, or no expert). Verdicts and perceptions of defendant's claim were dependent variables	Males rendered more guilty verdicts than females and non-students were more likely to render guilty verdicts than students.  Male mock jurors perceived the defendant as more likely to be fearful and trapped in the relationship when the defendant was passive compared to active.  Male participants rated the

Study (full reference)	Sample Size	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
Schuller, R. A., & Rzepa, S. (2002). Expert testimony pertaining to battered woman syndrome: Its impact on jurors' decisions. Law and Human Behavior, 26, 655-673.	200	200 participants included undergraduate students (120 women and 80 men) recruited from introductory psychology classes at a large Canadian university. Mean age 20.6.	Participants were presented with a criminal homicide trial based on Lavallee v. Regina (1990) involving a battered woman who killed her abuser. Within the trial, response history (passive, active), absence or presence of nullification instruction to disregard the strict application of the law, and expert testimony pertaining to battered woman syndrome (present, absent) were systematically varied. Dependent variables included verdict and perceptions of the defendant's claims.	defendant more psychologically stable than female mock jurors.  Women and those provided with expert testimony of the battered woman's syndrome found the defendant more mentally unstable.
Schuller, R., Wells, E., Rzepa, S., & Klippenstine, M. (2004). Rethinking battered woman syndrome evidence: The impact of	172	172 undergraduate students (94 women, 78 men) (mean age 20.19) recruited from introductory psychology classes at a large Canadian university.	Experimental study in which participants were provided with a criminal homicide case of a battered woman who had killed her abuser. Manipulated variables included imminence (direct confrontation or non-	Female participants (and participants in the direct confrontational scenario) found the defendant less in control of her actions and were more likely to believe the defendant's claim

Study	Sample	<b>Sample Characteristics</b>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
alternative forms of expert testimony on mock jurors' decisions.  Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science, 36, 127-136.			confrontational), presence of expert testimony (BWS, social agency, none). Participant gender was also explored. Dependent variables included verdict and perceptions of case	Men were less likely to believe the defendant's claim in the non-confrontational condition.
Braden-Maguire, J., Siga1, J. & Perrino, C. (2005). "Battered women who kill: Variables affecting simulated jurors." <i>Crime</i> & <i>Delinquency</i> , 20, 403- 408.	80 50	Thirty-seven male and 43 female undergraduate students participated, as part of their requirements for an introductory psychology course. The sample was drawn from undergraduates at a medium-sized New York metropolitan university. The participants' mean age was 22. Thirty-seven were white, 19 were African- American, 15 were Hispanic, and nine were Asian. Three of the participants were seniors; 16 were juniors, 18 were sophomores, and 43 were	Experiment A written trial transcript was chosen for this study. The battered woman defendant was depicted as white or African-American, and had been either physically or emotionally abused. Attached to the trial transcript was a Juror Decision Sheet, on which participants indicated their judgment: guilty, not guilty by reason of self-defense ('NG'), or not guilty by reason of insanity (NGI) personal knowledge of domestic violence. The 12-item Battered Woman Questionnaire (BWQ; Green et al., 1989), which measures a participant's knowledge of the' battering situation on a Likert-type scalee from 1 to 7, was then given. These questions	Contrary to predictions, there were no significant differences in number of guilty verdicts between male and female participants.

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
		freshmen. Nineteen male and 31 female undergraduate at a HBU, located outside a large city in Maryland, participated. Participants were volunteers from undergraduate psychology classes. Their mean age was 23, and all participants were single.	included participants' gender, ethnic group, citizenship, marital status, year in school, and personal knowledge of domestic violence.	
Russell, B. L., & Melillo, L. S. (2006). Attitudes Toward Battered Women Who Kill Defendant Typicality and Judgments of Culpability. Criminal Justice and Behavior, 33, 219-241.	618	410 female and 208 male undergraduate students were recruited from two St. Louis Universities. Participants were recruited during class sessions. The mean age of the respondents was 20.28 years old.	An experiment investigating 2 (defendant typicality: typical vs. atypical) X2 (response history: active vs. passive) X2 (case fact. This study investigated the influences of defendant characteristics, expert, testimony, self-defense, and battered partner attributes on conviction in a homicide trial. Pattern: confrontational or non-confrontational) X2 (respondent gender) between subjects factorial design. This study evaluated the hypothesis that jurors use	Verdicts are directly influenced by the female defendant's typicality and response history (passive vs. active) of the defendant.  Female defendants portrayed as atypical with an active response history received more guilty verdicts and were less credible. Conversely, typical defendants with passive response histories were most likely to receive verdicts of not guilty and found to be more credible.  Traditional gender effects showed

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			

			prototypical standards of battered	men were more likely than women
			women to reach conclusions	to render guilty verdicts in all
			about defendants in these cases.	conditions.
Kern, R., Libkuman, T., & Temple, S. L. (2007). Perceptions of domestic violence and mock jurors' sentencing decisions. <i>Journal of Interpersonal Violence</i> , 22, 1515-1535.	173	58 men and 115 women from psychology courses at a Mid-western university participated in the study in exchange for extra credit.	Experiment  The purpose of the investigation was to examine the influence of the victim's provocation and hopeful-ness on the sentencing of a husband convicted of domestic violence.  Students participated in one of four conditions, with 50 students participating in the provoking, hopeful condition; 41 in the provoking, unhopeful condition; 39 in the unprovoking, hopeful condition; and 43 in the unprovoking, unhopeful condition.  Participants were tested in groups ranging from 2 to 18.	Gender was associated with predeliberation sentencing, with women delivering more-severe sentences than men.  The effect of gender was not present in the post-deliberation sentencing, indicating that deliberation produced a sentencing compromise between male and female mock jurors
Cormier, N. &	108	108 undergraduates from	Repeated measures experimental	Students were more likely to call
Woodworth, M. (2008).		a Canadian university (41	design to examine reactions to	police, convict the perpetrator of
Do you see what I see?		men and 67 women) and	scenarios depicting male-female,	assault, and found the perpetrator

PASK#12.Online Tables – Table 2b. Differences in prosecution and jury decision making in intimate partner violence cases by socio-demographic categories: Jury decision-making

Study

Sample | Sample Characteristics | Study Type | Results

Study	Sample	<u> </u>	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size	_		
The influence of gender stereotypes on student and Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) perceptions of violent same-sex and opposite-sex relationships.  Journal of Aggression, Maltreatment & Trauma 17, 478-505.		62 Royal Canadian Mounted Police (35 men and 27 women) Student mean age 23.5 and RCMP mean age 39.78	male-male, female-male and female-female abuse. Authors examined 4 vignettes (based on Harris and Cook's 1994 study) of a dispute escalating to a physical altercation. Subjects rated the seriousness, culpability, abuse severity, likeability, likelihood of police intervention, recidivism, etc.	more criminally responsible, more violent and less likeable if the victim was a female and the perpetrator was male.  Police were also more likely to call police if they witnessed a male victimizing a female, more likely to believe a male should be convicted of assault if the victim was a wife compared to if the perpetrator and victim were both females.  Students considered male-female abuse more abusive than other
Ragatz, L., Russell, B. (2010). Sex, sexual orientation, and sexism: What influence do these factors have on verdicts in a crime of passion case? <i>The Journal of Social Psychology</i> , 150, 341-360.	458	458 participants were recruited using an online study of adults (163 males and 287 females). Mean age 37.5 years. Participants were primarily whites (84.7%)	This experiment examined verdict, legal elements and sentencing in a crime of passion case where a defendant killed his/her partner while walking in on them having an extra-marital affair. The study manipulated defendant sex, sexual orientation and examined participant sex on	scenarios compared to the RMCP.  Verdicts did not differ based on the sexual orientation of the couple and defendant sex. Sentence length was significantly longer for male defendants compared to female defendants.  An interaction between defendant gender and couple sexual orientation

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
			decisions of guilt, verdict, sentencing and legal elements – the study also examined the relationship between these variables and sexism.	found heterosexual female defendants were rated least guilty and received significantly shorter sentence lengths than heterosexual male defendants and homosexual.
				Male mock jurors were 1.65 times more likely to opt for a more harsh punishment of second degree murder compared to female mock jurors who were more likely to choose a verdict of voluntary manslaughter. No mock juror gender effects were found for sentence length.
Russell, B., Ragatz, L., & Kraus, S. (2010).	442	158 male and 284 female undergraduate students	This experiment varied defendant gender, victim gender, and the	Female mock jurors were more likely to believe that female
Self-Defense and legal		with a mean age of	presence of expert testimony of	defendants in a heterosexual
decision making: The		28.79. Respondents	the battered person syndrome.	relationship exhibited more battered
role of defendant and		included a college	The study investigated the	partner attributes compared to male
victim gender and		sample of undergraduates	influences of defendant	defendants in the same-sex
gender-neutral expert		and an online sample of	characteristics, expert, testimony,	relationships, female defendants in
testimony of the battered		adults. The	self-defense, and battered partner	same-sex relationships, and
partner's		Majority of participants	attributes on conviction in a	heterosexual male defendants.
syndrome. Partner		were white (91%),	homicide trial.	
		heterosexual orientation		Male mock jurors were less likely to

Study	Sample	Sample Characteristics	Study Type	Results
(full reference)	Size			
Abuse, 1, 399-419.		(92.7%), and single		believe that homosexual male
		(51.6%). Participants		defendants experienced attributes
		were college		associated with the battered person
		undergraduate students		syndrome.
		from small, northwestern		
		state-funded liberal arts		Male mock jurors were also more
		college and individuals		likely to believe the defendant
		whom signed up with		should have left the relationship
		Study Response Center		prior to the incident compared to
		website.		female participants.
Terrance, C. A., Plumm,	197	108 men and 96 women	This experimental study had	Male participants held victims more
K. M., & Thomas, S. A.		with a mean age of	participants read a scenario of a	responsible for their own
(2011). Perceptions of		20.81. The sample was	police interview of a claim of	victimization more than female
domestic vio-lence in		primarily white.	domestic violence. Variables	participants.
hetero-sexual relation-			manipulated included gender of	
ships: Impact of victim			the victim, previous response to	Male participants rated male victims
gender and history of			violence (passive or aggressive).	as more responsible for their own
response. Partner			The authors also explored	assault compared to a female victim.
Abuse, 2, 208-223.			participant gender and the	
			interactions with those variables	Women were more likely to believe
			on perceived victimization,	a female's claim of victimization
			responsibility, plausibility, and	more than men and believed the
			perceived danger.	victim was trapped in the relation-
				ship when the victim was female.